## Alissander Balemberg

# MOSSOP'S REVISION PARAMETERS AS ANALYTICAL CATEGORIES IN THE ANALYSIS OF A SONG OF ICE AND FIRE IN BRAZIL

Dissertação submetida ao Programa de Pós-Graduação em Inglês da Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina para a obtenção do Grau de Mestre em Estudos da Tradução.

Orientador: Prof. Dr. Lincoln P. Fernandes

# Ficha de identificação da obra elaborada pelo autor através do Programa de Geração Automática da Biblioteca Universitária da UFSC.

Balemberg, Alissander

Mossop's revision parameters as analytical categories in the analysis of "A Song of Ice and Fire" in Brazil /

Alissander Balemberg ; orientador, Lincoln P Fernandes - Florianópolis, SC, 2014. 119 p.

Dissertação (mestrado) - Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina, Centro de Comunicação e Expressão. Programa de Pós-Graduação em Letras/Inglês e Literatura Correspondente.

Inclui referências

1. Letras. 2. Estudos da Tradução. 3. Análise e Tradução de Textos. 4. Revisão da Tradução. 5. Erros de Tradução. I. Fernandes, Lincoln P. II. Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina. Programa de Pós-Graduação em Letras/Inglês e Literatura Correspondente. III. Título.

#### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

These two years I spent in the MA program provided me with several rewarding experiences in my life. Arriving at this point was possible thanks to several people who supported me throughout this journey. Therefore, I would like to take this opportunity to thank those who somehow helped me in this achievement.

My mom Sueli Sander Balemberg and my dad Ezequiel Balemberg for supporting my emotionally and always believing in me.

Prof. Lincoln P. Fernandes for accepting to be my supervisor and for encouraging me to continue my academic career after finishing my undergraduation and my MA Program.

Prof. Maria Lúcia de Barbosa Vasconcellos for the incredible insights and support during my MA Qualifying Program and also for accepting my invitation to be part of the examination board.

Prof. Meta Elisabeth Zipser and Prof. Beatriz Viégas-Faria for accepting my invitation to participate in the examination board of my study.

Prof. Marco Antonio Esteves da Rocha for the classes and support on parallel corpus and alignment of texts.

Finally, my friends: Noelice R. Costa, Bernardo S. Oliveira, André Pfeiffer and Jaison P. Rezine for the long talks, emotional support and laughter that kept me going when my path was not always so easy to follow.

#### ABSTRACT

The aim of this research is to contribute to the area of Translation Studies by transforming the parameters of Mossop (2001)'s translation revision model into an analysis tool categories to look at the translation errors of the book A Game of Thrones. Since 1991, the American fantasy writer George R. R. Martin has been writing the epic fantasy book series called A Song of Ice and Fire. After the television adaptation was announced by HBO and the first episode was broadcasted, the A Song of Ice and Fire book series, originally written in North American English (EN-US), has been translated into more than 25 languages until 2013, among which, there is the Brazilian Portuguese (PT-BR) translation, As Crônicas de Gelo e Fogo, available by the Brazilian publishing house Leva. However, instead of working with a translation of its own, Leya used the European Portuguese (PT-PT) translation by Jorge Candeias for the first book – without his knowing – and made what they believed to be the necessary adaptations from the PT-PT to the PT-BR, thus presenting several perceptions of uneasiness reported by readers over the Internet. As a consequence, as a researcher, I felt motivated to investigate and systematize this uneasiness. Bearing this panorama in mind, the research questions informing are the following: (i) How can Mossop's model account for occurrences of translation errors in the source text (ST) - target text (TT) comparison?; (ii) Are the parameters proposed in the model sufficient to classify all occurrences of errors in the PT-BR translation? Is it necessary to expand the model? What other parameters could be included?; and (iii) To what extent Mossop's model can really be effective for translation revisers to carry out their task? The research method includes unilingual and bilingual readings of the book A Game of Thrones in EN-US and PT-BR, parallel corpus, analysis and classification of the translation errors occurrences. The most important results of the study pointed out: (i) Mossop's model parameters cannot account for all the translation errors found; and (ii) the model had to be expanded in order to include a new category, Consistency.

**Keywords:** Translation Studies, Text Analysis and Translation, Genre Translation, Translation Revision and Translation Errors.

#### RESUMO

O objetivo desta pesquisa é contribuir para a área de Estudos da Tradução ao transformar os parâmetros do modelo de revisão de Mossop (2001) em categorias de uma ferramenta de análise para investigar os erros de tradução do livro A Game of Thrones. Desde 1991, o escritor americano de fantasia George R. R. Martin vem escrevendo a série de livros de fantasia épica chamada A Song of Ice and Fire. Após a adaptação televisiva ser anunciada pela HBO e o primeiro episódio ser televisionado, a série de livros originalmente escrita no inglês americano (EN-US) foi traduzida para mais de 25 idiomas até 2013, dentre os quais se encontra a tradução para o português brasileiro (PT-BR), As Crônicas de Gelo e Fogo, disponível pela editora Leya. No entanto, em vez de utilizar sua própria tradução, a Leva utilizou a tradução em português europeu (PT-PT) de Jorge Candeias para o primeiro livro - sem o conhecimento do tradutor - e fez o que acreditavam ser as adaptações necessárias do PT-PT para o PT-BR, apresentando, como resultado, várias sensações de desconforto na leitura reportadas pelos leitores na internet. Como consequência, como pesquisadora me senti motivada a investigar e a sistematizar esse desconforto. Considerando este contexto, as perguntas de pesquisa são as seguintes: (i) Como o modelo de Mossop dá conta das ocorrências dos erros de tradução na comparação entre texto fonte e texto alvo?; (ii) Os parâmetros propostos no modelo são suficientes para classificar todas as ocorrências de erros na tradução PT-BR? É necessária a expansão do modelo? Se sim, quais outros parâmetros poderiam ser incluídos?; e (iii) Até que ponto o modelo de Mossop pode realmente ser eficaz para a realização das tarefas dos revisores de tradução? O método de pesquisa inclui leituras unilíngue e bilíngue do livro A Game of Thrones em EN-US e PT-BR, corpus paralelo, análise e classificação das ocorrências de erros de tradução. Os resultados mais importantes do estudo salientados: (i) Os parâmetros do modelo de Mossop não são suficientes para classificar todos os erros de tradução encontrados; e (ii) o modelo teve que ser expandido para incluir uma nova categoria, Consistência.

**Palavras-chave:** Estudos da Tradução, Análise e Tradução de Textos, Tradução de Gênero, Revisão da Tradução e Erros de Tradução.

# **Table of Contents**

# **Chapter 1 – Introduction**

| 1.1.   | Initial Remarks                                     | 21 |
|--------|---|----|
|        | Context of Investigation                            |    |
|        | Objective and Research Questions                    |    |
|        | Relevance of the Research Work                      |    |
|        | Organization of the Thesis                          |    |
| 1.5.   | Organization of the Thesis                          | 23 |
| Chapte | r 2 – Theoretical Framework                         |    |
| Спари  |   |    |
| 2.1.   | Initial Remarks                                     | 26 |
|        | Translation Revision                                |    |
| 2.3.   | Types of Revision: Self-Revision and Other-Revision | 26 |
|        | Unilingual and Comparative Revision                 |    |
|        | Translation Error                                   |    |
|        | Mossop's Model Of Translation Revision              |    |
| 2.6.1  |   |    |
| 2.6.2  | . GROUP A – COMPLETENESS                            | 33 |
| 2.6.3  | . GROUP B – LOGIC                                   | 34 |
| 2.6.4  | . GROUP B – FACTS                                   | 35 |
| 2.6.5  | . GROUP C – SMOOTHNESS                              | 35 |
| 2.6.6  | . GROUP C – TAILORING                               | 36 |
| 2.6.7  | . GROUP C – SUB-LANGUAGE                            | 36 |
| 2.6.8  | . GROUP C – IDIOM                                   | 37 |
| 2.6.9  | . GROUP C – MECHANICS                               | 37 |
| 2.6.1  | 0. GROUP D – LAYOUT                                 | 38 |
| 2.6.1  | 1. GROUP D – TYPOGRAPHY                             | 38 |
| 2.6.1  | 2. GROUP D – ORGANIZATION                           | 39 |
| 2.7.   | The Brief   | 39 |
| 2.7.1  | . Translation Brief                                 | 40 |
| 272    | REVISION RRIFE                                      | 42 |

# Chapter 3 – Method

| 3.1.<br>3.2. |       | alytical Procedures                           |                  |
|--------------|-------|---|------------------|
| Chap         | ter 4 | - Results And Discussion                      |                  |
| 4.1.         |       | tial Remarks                                  | 46               |
| 4.2.         |       | anslation Errors Analysis Brief               |                  |
| 4.3.         | An    | alysis of the Occurrences of Translation Erro | ors in A Game of |
| Thron        | 1es   |   | 47               |
| 4.3          | .1.   | ACCURACY                                      |                  |
| 4.3          | .2.   | COMPLETENESS                                  | 57               |
| 4.3          | .3.   | Logic   |                  |
| 4.3          | .4.   | SMOOTHNESS                                    |                  |
| 4.3          | .5.   | IDIOM   |                  |
| 4.3          | .6.   | MECHANICS                                     |                  |
| 4.3          | • • • | NEW CATEGORY: CONSISTENCY                     |                  |
| 4.4.         |       | search Questions Revisited                    |                  |
| 4.4          | .1.   | RESEARCH QUESTION #1                          |                  |
| 4.4          | .2.   |   |                  |
| 4.4          | .3.   | RESEARCH QUESTION #3                          | 88               |
| Chap         | ter 5 | – Final Considerations                        |                  |
| 5.1.         | Fir   | nal Remarks                                   | 90               |
| 5.2.         |       | mmary of the Study                            |                  |
| 5.3.         |       | plications of the Study                       |                  |
| 5.4.         |       | mitations of the Study and Suggestions for I  |                  |
| Refer        | ences | 3   | 93               |

# List of Tables

| Table 1: Translation Brief                                       | 41  |
|--|-----|
| Table 2: Occurrences of Translation Errors according to Mossop's |     |
| Model  | 48  |
| Table 3: Occurrence of Accuracy                                  |     |
| Table 4: Occurrence of Completeness                              |     |
| Table 5: Occurrence of Logic                                     |     |
| Table 6: Occurrence of Smoothness                                |     |
| Table 7: Occurrence of Idiom                                     | 68  |
| Table 8: Occurrence of Mechanics                                 |     |
| Table 9: Case of Consistency - "Winter is/was coming"            | 76  |
| Table 10: Case of Consistency - Converted Units of Measurement   | 77  |
| Table 11: Case of Consistency - Non-Converted Units of Measurem  | ent |
|  | 78  |
| Table 12: Case of Consistency - "Protector of the Realm"         |     |
| Table 13: Case of Consistency - "Doom (of Valyria)"              | 80  |
| Table 14: Case of Consistency - "Kings in the North"             |     |
| Table 15: Case of Consistency - "Narrow Sea"                     |     |
| Table 16: Case of Consistency - "Stables"                        |     |
| Table 17: Case of Consistency - "Jest(s)"                        |     |
|  |     |

# **List of Figures**

| Figure 1: Diagram Locating this Research Work | 21 |
|---|----|
|---|----|

# Appendices

| Appendix 1: Full Table of Occurrences of Translation Errors | 95   |
|---|------|
| Appendix 2: Cover of the PT-BR edition, A Guerra dos Tronos | .117 |
| Appendix 3: Cover of the EN-US edition, A Game of Thrones   | .118 |

#### **Abbreviations**

**CLP** Content, Language, and Presentation

**EN-US** North American English

GT Genre Translation
PT-BR Brazilian Portuguese
PT-PT European Portuguese
SL Source Language
ST Source Text

**TAT** Text Analysis and Translation

TL Target Language

TMS Translation Memory Systems

TT Target Text

# Chapter 1 Introduction

#### 1.1. Initial Remarks

Translation Studies (TS) emerged as a branch of applied linguistics in the early 1950s. According to Baker (1998), since the 1980s, translation have scholars been borrowing theoretical frameworks methodologies from several other disciplines, such as psychology, philosophy, and cultural studies. Moreover, such bestowed materials are being reassessed and adapted to meet the specific needs of this recent area, contributing not only to the growth of the field, but also to its independence. In the mapping of the field proposed by Williams and Chesterman (2002), the area of TS can be divided into twelve research areas which include Text Analysis and Translation (TAT) and Genre Translation (GT) among them, which are the two research areas the present study is inserted within, as shown in Figure 1.

Translation
Studies
This Research

Text Analysis
and
Translation
Translation

Figure 1: Diagram Locating this Research Work

This research work belongs to the area of TAT because the objective is to analyze – from a descriptive perspective – the translation errors present in the first book of the series *A Song of Ice and Fire*, called *A Game of Thrones*. Furthermore, this study also belongs to GT because I am focusing on a particular textual genre, that is, adult epic fantasy.

#### 1.2. Context of Investigation

Since 1991, the North American fantasy writer George R. R. Martin has been writing the adult epic fantasy book series called *A Song of Ice and Fire*. Until 2013, five books were published: *A Game of Thrones* (published in 1996), *A Clash of Kings* (1998), *A Storm of Swords* (2000), *A Feast for Crows* (2005), and *A Dance with Dragons* (2011)<sup>1</sup>. The sixth book, *The Winds of Winter*, is expected to be released in 2014<sup>2</sup>. The North American cable television Home Box Office (HBO) optioned for a television adaptation, naming it *Game of Thrones* after the first book and premiering the first episode in April 2011<sup>3</sup>.

Once the television adaptation was announced by HBO and the first episode was broadcasted, sales of the books were boosted all around the world. As a consequence, the *A Song of Ice and Fire* book series, originally written in North American English (EN-US), was translated into more than 25 languages until 2013<sup>4</sup>, among which, there is the Brazilian Portuguese (PT-BR) translation, *As Crônicas de Gelo e Fogo*, published by the Brazilian publishing house Leya.

However, perhaps based on the interest of making the book series available in Brazil as soon as possible and also holding the copyrights of the published translation, instead of working with a translation of its own, Leya took what could be considered a shortcut, deciding to use the European Portuguese (PT-PT) translation of Jorge Candeias for the first book. For that, Leya made what they believed to be the necessary adaptations from the PT-PT to the PT-BR.

It took me a while to read the books and, perhaps as the same case of many readers of George R. R. Martin's novels, I only knew of

Source: http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/A\_Song\_of\_Ice\_and\_Fire

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> "Game of Thrones' author George R.R. Martin gives lengthy interview on 'Winds of Winter' and beyond". Hypable.com. Retrieved August 27, 2013.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Source: http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/A\_Song\_of\_Ice\_and\_Fire#TV\_series

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Source: http://www.georgerrmartin.com/gallery/thrones.html

the existence of A Song of Ice and Fire book series and decided to read them after I watched the first episode of HBO's Game of Thrones. Until I finally started reading the first book – Guerra dos Tronos in Brazilian Portuguese –, some friends of mine who were already reading it told me that the translation was somewhat uneasy, that the text did not flow as well as it should, and that the book contained what they called "translation errors" as well. As soon as I started my reading, I also felt this uneasiness right on the very first pages. Also, as a text reviser myself, it was not possible for me to proceed the reading without noticing terms, and sometimes whole sentences, that did not sound natural to Brazilian native speakers; nor to ignore the feeling of sometimes reading what seemed to be literal translations of the original text in EN-US. Baffled by such perceptions and the comments of my friends. I decided to make some research on that, trying to find out whether other readers had the same impressions and what could be causing them.

Surprisingly, I found not only other several complaints across the Internet from Brazilian readers who had the same problem, but I also stumbled on an article on the Jorge Candeias's blog, the PT-PT translator of A Song of Ice and Fire. In this article called Sobre a tradução de Martin no Brasil: o processo<sup>5</sup> (On the translation of Martin ['s novel] in Brazil: the process, my translation), Candeias explained that Leva bought his translation from the Portuguese publishing house Saída da Emergência and adapted it to PT-BR. However, he was not aware of this transaction and it only came into his knowing that he was also the author of the PT-BR translation (as stated on the first page of the book Guerra dos Tronos) when the Brazilian website Omelete disseminated a weblink<sup>6</sup> to the chapters in PDF file through the social media Twitter<sup>TM</sup>. Shocked, Candeias stated that, until then, he had no idea of such process since no communication had taken place between him and Saída de Emergência or Leya. The same way Brazilian readers expressed their discontentment with the PT-BR translation through the Internet, he also criticized Leya for making such decisions. As explained by Candeias, he was criticized by Brazilian readers and accused of errors caused by Leya's adaptation and also errors of his own, that could

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Source: http://lampadamagica.blogspot.com.br/2010/08/sobre-traducao-demartin-no-brasil-o.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> http://www.omelete.com.br/imagens/diversos/cap1.pdf

have been avoided in the PT-BR translation if there had been any communication between him and Leya's revisers, for example.

Moreover, Jorge Candeias talked about the same perception of uneasiness that my friend and I had when we read *Guerra dos Tronos*. However, the translator talked about errors but he presented no criteria for defining such errors. As a researcher, I felt motivated to systematize my uneasiness, this feeling telling me that there was something wrong with that translation, so that I could analyze it and understand its causes. However, feelings, sensations, intuitions and responses cannot be systematized. I needed criteria to base my research work on so that I could sort right from wrong. Consequently, I looked for a model that discussed errors in translation with criteria for this systematization, but I did not find any that would fit into this kind of discussion and provide me with a theoretical background.

I found an interesting model created by Brian Mossop that covers occurrences of errors. However, Mossop's model was not created for this kind of systematization I intended to do, but rather for revision of translation. As a result, I am borrowing the parameters of his model and adapting them to my research work as a tool for analysis of translation error.

#### 1.3. Objective and Research Questions

Bearing this scenario in mind, this piece of research work aims at testing the applicability of a model proposed for translation revision by Brian Mossop as an analytical tool to look at translation errors in Leya's PT-BR version of *A Song of Ice and Fire*. The main research questions informing this study are as follows.

- (RQ1) How can Mossop's model account for occurrences of translation errors in the source text (ST) target text (TT) comparison?
- (RQ2) Are the parameters proposed in the model sufficient to classify all occurrences of errors in the PT-BR translation? Is it necessary to expand the model? What other parameters could be included?
- (RQ3) To what extent Mossop's model can really be effective for translation revisers to carry out their task?

Through the descriptive perspective of the research questions the present study is expected to bring some insights to the area of translation studies.

#### 1.4. Relevance of the Research Work

Despite the fact that there is a great amount of studies in translation studies, as mentioned before, to my knowledge no study in the area of translation revision verifying the applicability of Mossop's translation revision model in the analysis of translation error was found to exist. Consequently, it is expected that this research will bring some new insights into the area of translation revision by borrowing the categories of Mossop's model and applying them as a tool for the analysis of translation errors, thus offering more effective resource for translation revisers to carry out their tasks as well.

#### 1.5. Organization of the Thesis

The present study is organized into five chapters. Chapter 1 introduces this research, presents its objectives and the research questions seeking to achieve them. Chapter 2 presents the theoretical framework as follows: firstly, the concept of translation revision is discussed; second, the types of revision are explained; third, the main concepts – translation error, Brian Mossop's translation revision model and the brief – informing this study are discussed in detail.

Chapter 3 focuses on the research methods: the data source, tools for data analysis and the analytical procedures. Chapter 4 presents the brief constructed specifically for this study, then focuses on data analysis and, finally, revisits the research questions. Chapter 5 presents the final remarks of the study, a summary, the limitations and suggestions for further research.

# Chapter 2 Theoretical Framework

#### 2.1. Initial Remarks

As this study interfaces with Text Analysis and Translation (TAT) and Genre Translation (GT), this chapter is dedicated to a brief overview of key-terms to this study: (i) reviser; (ii) translation error; (iii) brief; and (iv) Mossop's model of Translation Revision including a brief review of the literature on revision that is fundamental for this study.

#### 2.2. Translation Revision

When it comes to the reviser, Mossop (2001), Somers (2001), Künzli (2007) and Ganser (2011) agree on what can be considered basic characteristics that are necessary for a successful revision: a qualified, experienced, and professional translator. Nonetheless, they differ on who exactly this person should be — whether the translator herself or a second person other than the original — and on the pros and cons of each possibility. As a result, the next two sections discuss two kinds of translation revision, (i) self-revision and (ii) other-revision.

## 2.3. Types of Revision: Self-Revision and Other-Revision

According to Mossop (2001), self-revision is "an integral part of the translation production process in which one revises one's own translation" (p. 170). In other words, the role of reviser is attributed to the very same translator working on the translation activity. Moreover, once one is assigned both parts, the translator is free to carry out the self-revision any time during the translation activity.

Mossop (ibid.) explains that the production of a translation can be divided into three phases and five tasks.

Three phases of translation production

- (1) pre-drafting (before sentence-by-sentence drafting begins)
- (2) drafting
- (3) post-drafting (after sentence-by-sentence drafting is complete)

Five tasks to be performed

- (1) Interpret the source text.
- (2) Compose the translation.
- (3) Conduct the research needed for tasks 1 and 2.
- (4) *Check* the draft translation for errors an correct if necessary.
- (5) Decide the implications of the brief: how do the intended users and uses of the finished product affects tasks 1 to 4? (p. 135)

The revision carried out by the translator can be intermixed with the drafting activity, whilst he is still working on the possible outcomes in the translation.

Mossop (2007) mentions the experiment carried out by Asadi et al (2005), which explores the different distribution of the self-revision phases throughout the translation activity. Two different approaches were identified, with writing, researching and revising tasks taking place during all three phases of pre-drafting, drafting and post-drafting. Some of the participants did most of their self-revision as they wrote their drafts, leaving little work to be done at the post-drafting phase; that is, they preferred to evaluate and make possible changes in their translation at the beginning of their translation activity. And some of the participants decided to leave most part of the revision after they drafted the translation, by writing their draft as quickly as they could; that is, they decided to self-revise their translation once the whole text had been already translated.

When it comes to the pros of self-revision, Mossop (2007) explains that when translators play the role of self-revisers, the temptation to substitute one's own approach to translation or one's personal lexical choices by imposing one's style is not an issue, once the operation occurs when dealing with one's own work. Also, "the self-reviser is familiar with the source text when the task begins" (Self-revision section, para. 1), thus resulting in an excellent approach in case of demand for speed.

On the other hand, according to Mossop (2007), in 2006 Claire Yi-yi Shih carried out a study to explore revision from the translators' point of view, and she pointed out that, depending on the type of translation and also on the deadline, self-revision was not given much attention whenever translators were sure there would be a reviser, however unprofessional it may be if one chooses to simply skip or not to

pay proper attention to this phase. Additionally, Mossop (2001) explains that

[t]he disadvantage of relying on self-revision is that fewer errors will be detected: the translator has a certain blindness to the text (pp. 91-92).

If self-revision is a type of revision that somehow can make the translator blind to his own errors, then this role must be given to a second person other than the translator. By contrast to the first translator, the reviser's fresh eye will be able to detect translation errors much more easily. Basically, the second translator in charge of the revision can act as the first 'reader' once she is not familiar with the source text, thus detecting any mistakes in the textual level.

Mossop (2001) lists the possible different situations in which one can be assigned to revise the text of other authors.

- The person you are revising (the revisee) is a colleague at your own rank. You are revising each other's work.
- (2) The revisee is an employee at a lower rank (who reports either to you or to the department head). If heshe is a new employee, you may be responsible for on-job training.
- (3) The revisee is a student on a practicum whom you are training.
- (4) The revisees are members of a team translation project which you are heading. They are each contributing to a single text, and you are ensuring the unity of the final product.
- (5) The revisee is a contractor (a freelance or an employee of a translation agency) (p. 142).

However, Ganser (2011) states that most translators do not like to revise. The author believes that despite the fact that one be an excellent translator, it does not mean she will adapt at revising, since revising is an activity that requires, as stated by the author, "an enormous amount of patience, knowledge, experience, organization, concentration, connections, and more" (ibid., para. 8)

#### 2.4. Unilingual and Comparative Revision

Irrespective of working with self-revision or revision, there are two complementary ways of checking the translated text: by carrying out a (i) unilingual revision, and a (ii) comparative revision.

Unilingual revision, according to Mossop (2007, Unilingual revising section, para. 7), is the revision that taken place when the reviser has no access whatsoever to the source text. Although no study has been conducted – to my knowledge – on this subject so far, Mossop (ibid., Self-revision section, para. 20) states that a topic worth exploring is the fact that native speakers of the target language seem to have the some sort of ability to detect mistranslations when it comes to revising the work of others. However, this idea might lead to the wrong conclusion that the best reviser would be a native speaker of the target language. This conclusion is questionable, for it depends on the reviser's knowledge on the area of the text he will revise. For example, the reviser may be a native speaker of the target language, but has no knowledge of the genre of the text whatsoever, thus lacking textual conventions knowledge of that genre.

Mossop (2007, Unilingual revising section, para. 2-4) states that Brunette *et al* (2005) have conducted an experiment on unilingual revision. However, the result was not as good as had been expected: on the one hand, unilingual revision is a much less time-consuming activity; and, on the other hand, it does not always yield a better quality final product.

Comparative revision is the second phase to the unilingual revision. In this kind of revision, the reviser has full access to the source text, being able to compare source text to target text as she chooses. In this way, it is possible to check for several revision parameters, such as register, style, and terminology consistency. As pointed out by Brunette *et al* (ibid.), comparative revision yields better results when it comes to accuracy, appropriateness to readership and purpose, and also readability. Nonetheless,

[c]omparative revision is much more time-consuming, [for] there is twice as much text to read, and it takes time to consider whether the translation adequately reflects the meaning of the source text (Mossop, 2007, Unilingual revising section, para. 1).

Consequently, this kind of revision may not be preferred if there is a demand for speed.

#### 2.5. Translation Error

Translation error is a key-term that arises whenever the subject of translation revision is discussed. As mentioned before, when one thinks of revision, it may bring to mind terms such as correction and improvement. These ones, on the other hand, are associated with the idea of fault or mistake, however unintentional.

"Translation error is any fault occurring in a translated text and results either from ignorance or from the inadequate application of a translation technique or translation strategy" (Palumbo, 2009, p. 125). In other words, translation error occurs whenever the translation text fails to achieve its purpose on some level, as a result from lack of translation strategy, translation technique or misuse of them. And it may occur at word, phrase, sentence, textual or pragmatic level.

As to the different types of translation errors, section 2.6 presents Mossop's model of translation revision in which the author provides parameters for translators and revisers to identify and avoid specific errors according to the purpose of the translation.

#### 2.6. Mossop's Model of Translation Revision

When it comes to the difficulties translators and revisers deal with when carrying out their tasks, Brian Mossop (2001, p, 88) mentions that one of the central issues is the trade-off between time and quality. Basically, once we live in a capitalist society, the faster a translation or a revision is completed, the better. However, regardless of working as a translator or a reviser, when self-revising or revising, it is essential to be aware that not always a full revision, i.e., one that covers all kinds of translation errors, is possible. It is necessary to rank priorities and decide on the degree of the revision.

Based on this, Mossop created a model for translation revision, presented in his book *Revising and Editing for Translators* (2001), which serves both translators and revisers willing to achieve the purpose of the text while meeting deadlines. As stated by the author, "[a]n exhaustive listing of things that can go wrong when translating would be very long indeed" (p. 99). As a result, he provided a summarized list

containing 12 revision parameters, i.e., parameters identifying and classifying translation errors. The revision parameters were divided into four groups, as listed below and further explained in the following subsection.

- Group A **Transfer** Problems of meaning transfer:
  - o (1) **Accuracy**: occurs when the translation does not "reflect the message of the source text" (Mossop, 2001, p. 100).
  - o (2) **Completeness**: occurs when any element of the message has been left out.
- Group B **Content** Problems of content:
  - (3) Logic: occurs when there is any nonsense or contradiction.
  - (4) Facts: occurs when there is any factual, conceptual or mathematical error.
- Group C **Language** Problems of language and style:
  - (5) Smoothness: occurs when the text does not flow due to lack of clear connections between sentences, clear relationships among the parts of each sentence, or any awkward, hard-to-read sentences.
  - o (6) **Tailoring**: occurs when the language is not suited to the users of the translation or to their use of it.
  - o (7) **Sub-language**: occurs when the style does not suit the genre, when there is any misuse of terminology, or phraseology does not match that used in the original target-language texts on the same subject.
  - (8) Idiom: occurs when a grammatical combination of words is not possible or is not common in the target language.
  - (9) Mechanics: occurs with the wrong usage of house style, punctuation, non-observed rules of grammar, or misspelling.
- Group D **Presentation** Problems of physical presentation:
  - o (10) **Layout**: occurs when there is any problem in the way the text is arranged on the page, such as spacing, indentation, margins, etc.

- o (11) **Typography**: occurs when there is any problem with text formatting, such as bolding, underlining, font type, font size, etc.
- o (12) **Organization**: occurs when there is any problem in the way the document as a whole is organized, such as page numbering, headers, footnotes, table of contents, etc.

#### 2.6.1. Group A – Accuracy

According to Brian Mossop, the first parameter of Group A, (1) Accuracy, is the most important feature of a translation. It concerns whether the TT reflects the message of the ST. However, when it comes to determining the ideal level of accuracy of a translated text (TT), some characteristics have to be taken into account. As explained by the author of the revision model, the level of accuracy desired in a translation – from the translator's point of view – and the level of accuracy expected from a text – from the reviser's point of view – may differ greatly depending on the type and the purpose of the final product. It other words, the level of precision may not be related to as much as it is possible to be accurate, but to be precise as it is necessary.

For example, suppose the source text (ST) is a legal document. Some of them may require an extreme level of accuracy. The same goes to texts with information relying on numbers, such as percentages. As to that concern, Brian Mossop suggests making a separate check for their correct reproduction in the TT. On the other hand, other kinds of texts, such as reports, may not require such a high level of accuracy once they are concerned with the reporting of main events or facts. In this case, descriptions or details do not need to be as accurate as they can be, as long as the key point can be correctly understood by the reader.

Furthermore, Brian Mossop points out that one should be careful as to a possible "overattention" to accuracy (pp. 100-101). Such concern might result in an unreadable text, possibly due to excess of details, any awkward or hard-to-read sentences that might lead the reader to distraction. "The trick would be to identify the right balance [between accuracy and readability] for the job at hand" (p. 101).

Mossop states that finding out whether a translation is accurate can be narrowed down to two points: (i) if the ST was correctly understood and, (ii) if this understanding was correctly expressed in the translation (p. 101). Moreover, although the most common inaccuracy

problems arise from incorrect understanding of the ST (p. 101), it is possible that the translator understood the ST correctly, but was not able to express it due to poor lexical choices (i.e. bad wording) that may result, for instance, in ambiguous sentences to the reader. In this case, the reviser is more likely to indentify such ambiguities – or the potential of becoming one – or any incorrect reading, because the reviser did not take part of the translation activity (i.e. there is no prior bias when it comes to the correct reading of the TT).

#### 2.6.2. Group A – Completeness

As to the second parameter of **Group A**, **(2) Completeness**, it relates to the lack of elements of the ST message in the TT. In his translation revision model, Brian Mossop discusses a principle called NANS, which is usually expected from translators when rendering the ST. Basically, translators should not add nor subtract – thus, the NANS acronym for "No Additions, No Subtractions" – any elements of the ST, unless they are asked to carry out any other task such as a summary or the writing of the gist of the ST.

The author points out that, when considering the NANS principal, he is not taking into account adaptations, that translators are free to choose when to add and/or delete significant parts of the ST. Also, one should not take too literally the NANS principle, because in order to make, for example, obscure passages of the ST comprehensible to the reader in the TT – whether due to poor wording, cultural or technical differences or any other reason that might be an obstacle –, small additions and/or subtractions are inevitable. Moreover, "the principle really only applies to *relevant* meaning" (p. 102), i.e. not every piece of information is important to the reader, thus some passages can be omitted or summarized.

In addition, Brian Mossop explains that Completeness might be seen as an implicit part of Accuracy. However, he believes Completeness should be treated as a separate parameter since "(...) it is too easy to leave something out accidentally" (p. 102). Based on this, he adds that guaranteeing that no accidental omissions of this kind will occur in the final version of the TT is the main role of the reviser. In order to avoid possible omissions, Mossop suggests counting paragraphs/sentences – although some of them may have been combined in the TT

Along with ensuring no accidental omissions, revisers are also responsible for:

- (i) Eliminating repetitiveness, which is, according to Mossop, "(...) typical of poorly written source texts" (p. 103). However, checking for repetitiveness may be a time-consuming task and may be left in TT for not being considered a priority;
- (ii) Eliminating redundancy, especially if there are spatial constraints; and,
- (iii) Ensuring that the TT does not contain any personal ideas of the translator, once completeness might require adding explanation of a cultural or a technical nature.

Brian Mossop also points out that it is important to pay special attention to electronic texts. Most of the texts are worked with software for editing documents or other media, such as HTML files or presentation software. Thus, it is possible that whole chunks of the source text might be missed once they are hidden in headers, footers, and other kinds of layout that are not always displayed on screen or even on a hard copy.

#### 2.6.3. **Group B – Logic**

As mentioned before, this parameter checks a text for any contradiction or nonsense that may be caused by impossible causal or temporal sequences. According to Mossop (p. 104), lack of Logic occurs in two ways:

- (1) "The source text itself is illogical, and the translator has not done anything about it". When one reads a translated text and stumble on a illogic excerpt, it can be assumed that such lack of logic was introduced by the translator. However, in this case, accidental contraction in the ST may have been occurred, for instance, due to wrong choice of words; inverted figures; or tautology, i.e. useless repetition of terms/words.
- (2) "The source text makes sense but the translator has introduced nonsense". Often this kind of lack of logic occurs due to inexperienced translators, such as student trainees, due to lack of ST knowledge. On the other hand, fatigue or lack of attention

due to time constraints can also lead experienced translators into making the same mistake.

#### **2.6.4. Group B – Facts**

Brian Mossop explains that the main role of a reviser does not include checking a text for errors of factual, conceptual and mathematical nature. However, such errors should not be overlooked and clients would be grateful if translators did not skip this task.

As stated by the author, "[t]hese errors are most often present in the original, but they may sometimes be introduced inadvertently by the translator" (p. 105). If that is the case, the translator should contact the client and abide by his wish. The possible outcomes are: the translator will have to correct the error in the translation; to make a list of the errors on a separate sheet and describe each one of them; or to contact the author of the ST and get agreement on a possible changing in its wording.

However, as pointed out by Mossop, some fact errors may be due to the ST's author's ignorance towards the fact itself. In this case, Mossop believes that correction in the translation would not be appropriate, but that, on the other hand, it is important the translator to indicate somehow that the error is due to the author.

Furthermore, since most fact errors are related to numbers, it is important to keep in mind that revisers often come from a linguistic background instead of a scientific one. Thus, it is "(...) ever so easy to let slip by a sentence which tell us that 68% of the respondents to a survey were men and 42% were women".

#### 2.6.5. Group C – Smoothness

Smoothness, along with Tailoring and Sub-language (the next two sections), define what is commonly called 'style'.

Smoothness can be narrowed down to one thing: readers should be able to grasp the meaning of the text the first time they read it, and also at normal reading speed.

However, some issues that may prevent smoothness in a text: lack of organized sentence structures, lack of connections – or the selection of poor ones – between sentences, words from the ST that

were careless imitated in the TT, and inconsistency or improper selection of verb tenses throughout the text.

Brian Mossop also points out that unsmooth writing in the TT cannot be justified by unsmooth writing in the ST. Although the TT does not need to present the same level of Smoothness of the ST – variations of Smoothness are accepted –, the proper degree of Smoothness should be determined by the client and the use of the translation.

Moreover, another probable issue that can interfere with the smooth reading of a text is the presence of too many source-languages sentences in the TT, such as names of institutions. For this case, Brian Mossop argues that the best approach is to reduce this variety in the translation as much as possible.

#### 2.6.6. Group C - Tailoring

When it comes to tailoring, Brian Mossop explains that "[t]he translation has to be suited to its readers and to the use they will make of it" (p. 107). Basically, depending on the kind of text, the TT must have the appropriate emotive tone and degree of technicality and formality. "[V]ocabulary must be suited to the education level of the readers" (p. 107) as well, as pointed out by the author.

Considering the audience of the TT, it is important to keep in mind that the use of the TT may be different of the ST. Consequently, some adaptations in the TT may be required. For example, if the ST is a transcript of a conversation, features of oral language such as repetitions and false starts should be removed. However, as pointed out by Mossop, "[j]ust occasional repetition or interjection should be left to remind the reader of the oral natural of the source text (...)" (p. 108).

## 2.6.7. Group C – Sub-language

As explained in the previous section, Tailoring, Sub-language also deals with the fact that there are different types and purposes for texts. Thus, depending on the genre and field of writing in the target language, texts draw "(...) on different lexical, syntactic and rhetorical resources of that language" (p. 108).

Moreover, according to the genre of a text, its writing requires one of two specific syntactic structures: noun-based structures and verbbased structures. Mossop provides one example for each of them: "the exigency of penury" (p. 108) for the former and "the things that you have to do if you're poor" (p. 108) for the latter.

In addition, sub-language also includes checking for field-specific terminology and typical phraseology of writers on the subject in the target language. In case the translator is not familiar with the field or its specific phrasings, Mossop suggests that the translator consults other texts of the field written by native speakers of the TL.

Since sub-language is concerned with different languages and also specific conventions of each, it includes features of genre structure as well, that is, the different ways and typical ways of presenting a text according to its genre and cultural background.

## 2.6.8. Group C – Idiom

As explained by Brian Mossop, "[i]n every language, only some of the grammatically possible combinations of words are actually used" (p. 109). These are called idiomatic combinations or idioms. The author explains that sometimes even experienced translators produce unidiomatic combinations under the influence of the ST, that is, by following the same line of thought of the ST they produce combinations that are perfectly grammatical and also comprehensible in the TT, but are not used.

Taking that into consideration, Brian Mossop states that having to deal with idiomatic combinations might be the main reason why revisers should be native speakers.

However, even after years working as a translator, one may be not sure about whether an expression is idiomatic or not, or whether he is just being somewhat mislead by the source language (SL). In this case, checking for the expression in a good dictionary and databases can reassure the translator about his outcome.

# 2.6.9. Group C – Mechanics

Whereas the previous parameters were concerned with features such as contradiction, spelling, grammar and purpose, mechanics regards the style manual or house style sheet of the translation.

Brian Mossop points out that when the translation is carried out in a word processor – i.e. electronic version –, and depending on the languages of the SL and the TL, the translator has to pay attention to mechanic details such as number-writing conventions and punctuation.

He also draws attention to the fact that, when it comes to capitalization, the translation of titles of articles may mislead the reader into thinking that the document the source text refers to is also available in the target language of the translation.

## **2.6.10. Group D – Layout**

Page layout may be one of the most important factors in readability. It is important to check for adequate spacing and margins so not to present a page overloaded with text.

Layout consistency is an important feature especially when source text and translation are compared, for example, when both texts are going to be published in a single document. As explained by the author, in cases like this, it is important to check if all paragraphs are indented; if all point-form listings are similarly positioned; if parallel headings are similarly placed on the page; and so on (p. 111).

Moreover, if even after taking care of these features some difference between texts can be noticed, translators can rely on other devices that contribute to this similarity between source and target texts, such as using larger/narrower column for the shorter text in case texts are side-by-side.

# 2.6.11. Group D – Typography

This is perhaps the simplest parameter of all presented in Mossop's model. However, it is no less important than the other ones. Typography is concerned with the consistency and moderation in the use of fonts. By moderation, Typography regards the variety of words in bold, italic case or underlined, with too many colors or capitalized which influences negatively the readability of a text. By consistency in the use of fonts, Typography is concerned with the using the same device for the same purpose in both ST and TT.

Moreover, Brian Mossop also calls attention to the use of such devices when dealing with emphasis, once emphasizing the same word or term of the ST in the TT not always makes sense in the TL.

Also, it is important to check whether all headings – section and subsections – have the same typographic treatment: if they are all bolded, italicized, underlined; if they are all the same size, and so on.

## 2.6.12. Group D – Organization

A number of features will enable the reader to go through a text and not only comprehend its structure, but also be able to locate a section, chapter, passage, and so on in a text. These features constitute the Organization parameter.

Organization includes page references; numbering and lettering; headers, footers and captions; and presentation features. As to page references, it is important to check if sections, subsections or passages of the ST are listed properly in the translation. For example, while a section may be on page 32 of the ST, it may be on page 34 of the TT. Also, the verification has to occur with numbering and lettering of chapters/sections, headings/subheadings, figures/tables, and so on, including their respective titles.

Brian Mossop suggests that in case there is an error in numbering or lettering in the ST (e.g. Chapter 3 is followed by another Chapter 3), this error should be reproduced in the TT or it can be corrected with client approval. However, if correction is not possible, the author advises signaling the error in a note.

#### 2.7. The Brief

As explained in section 2.6, Brian Mossop created a model with which it is possible to identify translation errors and also classify them into categories. However, how is it possible to identify a translation error? Will this translation error be an error, despite the context and the purpose of final product? How can one know for sure if a translation error is indeed an error and how to identify it?

In order to transform Mossop's parameters into an analytical tool to look at the translation errors in *A Game of Thrones* and answer these questions, it is necessary to establish criteria with which it is possible to identify, analyze and classify such errors. For that, I will draw on Christiane Nord's concept of the brief.

As stated by Nord (1997), when it comes to how a translation task should be carried out, according to the functionalist point of view, it is known that translators should guide their decisions based on what is expected of the text in the target-culture situation; that is, its communicative function.

For Nord (ibid.), the pieces of information necessary to guide the translator throughout the translation activity concerning the final

purpose of the TT can be gathered in what she refers to as the brief (p. 47). The brief works not only as a guide for the translation activity, but also as a means to determine whether or not the text achieved its intended communicative function.

As a consequence, the brief is a key-term for this study and I develop on it in the next two sections, 2.7.1 and 2.7.2.

Finally, before I start the analysis of the translation errors, I would like to remind that it is important that the brief for this study is taken into account. Without it, there is no telling right from wrong and this study may be seen merely as pinpointing errors by doing a contrastive analysis between ST and TT.

### 2.7.1. Translation Brief

The first step before a translation activity takes place is to create the translation brief (TS). According to the guide *Developing the Translation Brief: Why & How* available on *Hablamos Juntos*<sup>7</sup> website (Hablamos Juntos, 2009), the purpose of the Translation Brief is to gather information to orient translators regarding a source text and a target text (the translated text), aiding on the choice of an appropriate translation strategy, and also providing them with established specifications for quality assessment of the final product. Such information may include function, overall purpose and end use of the source text and target text, and it may be adapted to fit the specific needs of the translation project at hand Depending on the type of text, the TS may include directions on typography, page layout, preferred terminology, and other issues.

According to Mossop (2001), the various parts composing the translation brief may be obtained in three ways:

mentioned in this study —, as part of a initiative to improve patient-provider communication for Latinos.

7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Meaning "We speak together" in Spanish, *Hablamos Juntos* is a project administered by the major educational and clinical branch of the UCSF School of Medicine, located in California, San Francisco, US. As a result of the fast-growing Latino populations in California, the *Hablamos Juntos* website provides material for translating health care related materials to Spanish, including guiding material for translation — such as the Translation Brief

- They are explicit: the client states them orally or in writing when the request for translation is made.
- They are unstated but already known from previous similar jobs.
- They are elicited by the translation service, which takes the initiative of inquiring about this or that aspect of the brief (pp. 84-85).

Table 1 presents an example of a Translation Brief available at the Hablamos Juntos website (Hablamos Juntos, 2009).

**Table 1: Translation Brief** 

|                       | Source Text   | Target Text  |
|-----------------------|---|--|
|                       | English   |  |
| Function              | What is the intended purpose/use of the text?   | Will the target text be used in the same way?  |
| Audience              | Who is the recipient of the source text?  | Are the characteristics of<br>the target audience similar<br>or dissimilar to the source<br>audience?  |
| Time of<br>Reception  | When and by what means is the source text given to a patient and by whom? Is key information explained?                         | Will the target text be given in the same way and by whom? Will key information be explained?          |
| Place of<br>Reception | Where does the reader<br>encounter the text? Is the<br>text given to the reader or<br>picked up in the doctor's<br>office etc.? | Will the target audience encounter the text in the same way?   |
| Purpose               | Why was the source text written? Is there a desired reader response?  | Why is it being translated? Is the desired target reader response the same as for the source audience? |

#### 2.7.2. Revision Brief

After creating the translated text brief by defining its function and overall purpose, it is time to decide on the best revision strategy. However, after analysing the translation brief, it is possible to see that there is no specific information regarding what is expected from the reviser and the information contained in the translation brief is not enough to guide a reviser.

Künzli (2007) points out that "[i]n real-life translation revision, revisers very often get the same [translation] brief as the original translator" (Results and discussion section, para. 38). There is no information on the expected degree of revision — whether it is full or partial check —, nor the parameters the reviser is supposed to check. As the author describes, "[t]he absence of a specific revision brief can lead to additional uncertainties in the revision process" (ibid., para 38), thus resulting in a much more time consuming and even expensive revision.

After essential pieces of information such as the function, audience, and purpose of the target text were defined in the revision brief, it is time to determine the order of operations regarding as to what types of translation errors the reviser should check for, i.e. the order of operations for checking.

As explained by Mossop (2001, p. 121), the first step is to define the degree of revision. For this, you have to define two main aspects:

- If you are going to check the entire text or just parts of it
- Which parameters of the model you are going to check for: problems of **Transfer**, such as accuracy or any elements that may have been left out; **Content**, such as contradiction or factual errors; **Language**, such as style, idioms, grammar, spelling, punctuation; or **Presentation**, such as layout, typography, organization of the text.

Mossop (Ibid., p. 121) also explains that if the reviser is going to check for all of the translation errors listed above, i.e. transfer and what he calls CLP parameters (content, language, and presentation), the necessary type of revision is comparative, i.e. comparing the source text

to the target text. Once the type of revision has been established, the reviser needs to define the order she is going to check the parameters. Mossop (Ibid., p. 124) provides a sample of order of operations:

- Read the entire translation for any contradiction or nonsense, connections between sentences that may not be clear, any hardto-read sentences; the use of language and if it suits the purpose of the text; style, terminology; and idiomatic combinations.
- 2. Make a comparative check for Transfer, i.e. whether the text is accurate or have any elements that may have been left out of the final product.
- 3. Read the entire translation checking for any mistakes of punctuation and grammar; layout, consistency of terminology; and any Language error that may have been introduced during steps 1 and 2. Spell check should be done later.
- 4. In case numbers are important to the text, do a separate check for them.
- 5. Check the document as a whole for headers, footnotes, page numbering, table of contents, references, and so on.
- 6. Run Spellcheck after all steps have been followed and the necessary changes were made. Otherwise, errors that may have been introduced by the reviser might be missed.
- Make sure the document was saved after all the changes were made.

## Chapter 3 Method

#### 3.1. Data Source

The data source of the present study consists of the first eleven chapters of the first book of the *A Song of Ice and Fire* saga – called *A Game of Thrones* – that has been translated from North American English (EN-US) to Brazilian Portuguese (PT-BR). The data will be divided into two set of texts: (i) the original text in English, which is the source text (ST); and (ii) its translation to Brazilian Portuguese, which is the target text (TT). These texts will be included in the COPA-TRAD system that is being developed at UFSC and available at www.copatrad.ufsc.br, more specifically under the subgroup COPA-ERR, created for texts focusing on translation errors.

Moreover, the COPA-TRAD system works with parallel corpus, that is, "a set of texts in one language and their translations in another language" (Olohan, 2004, p. 24). According to Olohan (2004), the parallel corpora can be unidirectional, with the ST in language A and the TT in language B; or bidirectional, with the ST in language A and the TT in language B, and the ST in language B and the TT in language A. The COPA-TRAD system works with bidirectional corpora, thus providing a concordancing tool for research, i.e. "the corpus is searched for a word or phrase, and all instances, or a selection of instances, of that word are displayed on a line with surrounding text" (Olohan, 2004, p. 25).

However, before data is ready for research, it has to be aligned. As explained by Olohan (2004), "alignment means liking a unit of text in one language with a unit of a text in another language" (p. 26). For the alignment of the corresponding excerpts of both ST and TT, the free source code editor Notepad++<sup>TM</sup> is used.

# 3.2. Analytical Procedures

In order to be able to carry out the data analysis, the procedures will be based on the following steps:

• Retrieve the EN-US and PT-BR books in PDF and hard copy

- Convert the PDF files to TXT files by using an OCR (Optical Character Recognition) software
- Align the corresponding paragraphs of each language by using the free editor Notepad++, with the encoding in ANSI and conversion to UTF-8 (without BOM)
- Compare the TXT texts with the hard copies and reproduce in the TXT files the same mistakes (e.g. typos) of the hard copies so the TXT texts used for this study can be faithful to the hard copies
- Submit the data to the COPA-TRAD system
- Use the sample of order of operations suggested by Mossop (2001), explained in subsection 2.7.2 (pp. 35-36), except for steps 5-7, since these steps concern the paralinguistic level and this study is dealing with linguistics
- Compare the EN-US units with each of their PT-BR corresponding units
- Identify and classify the translation errors
- Discuss the findings

Now I would like to move on to the next chapter and present the results and discussion.

# Chapter 4 Results and Discussion

#### 4.1. Initial Remarks

This chapters presents: (i) the translation error analysis brief created specifically for this study; the (ii) analysis of the occurrences of translation errors found in the comparative analysis between the North American English (EN-US) version and the Brazilian Portuguese (PT-BR) translation of the first book of the *A Song of Ice and Fire* book series, *A Game of Thrones*, by George R. R. Martin; and the (iii) discussion of the findings.

## 4.2. Translation Errors Analysis Brief

After defining what a brief is and its role in section 2.7, it is crucial to create a brief specifically for this study, for the analysis of translation errors as an analytical tool. This way, it is possible to determine whether a translation error is indeed an error, for what may be considered a translation error may not be an error at all according to the brief.

In order to create this brief, I made an interview with the European translator of the *A Song of Ice and* Fire book series, Jorge Candeias, whose translation was adapted to Brazil. He explained to me that he is not used to create a translation brief for his tasks. According to him, publishing houses buy the copyright of the translation through the translator's agent and after that, the translator is free to carry out his task as he will. The only rules translators receive concerns the presentation of the text, that is, layout, typography and organization – as explained in sections 2.6.10 to 2.6.12.

That being considered, Candeias explained that after he has done a pre-reading of the text he is going to translate in order to identify the writing style and atmosphere created by the author in ST, so he can try to maintain or reproduce them in the TT. Furthermore, the translator said that this kind of evaluation does not follow the formality of a translation brief, although he stated to keep such guidelines in mind throughout the translation activity. Moreover, Candeias explained that, in the case of *A Game of Thrones*, he tried not to create words, terms or emphasis as hard as possible, keeping in mind that EN-US and PT-PT/PT-BR have emphasis on different words since they are two

languages grammatically different – the former being Anglophone and, the latter, Lusophone.

From what I have from the translation, I can construct, as a researcher, the following brief.

Try to be as close as possible to the ST in the TT concerning:

- Writing style
- Atmosphere
- Emphasis \*
- \* However, since this study is concerned with the linguistic level and emphasis is part of the paralinguistic features of a text, emphasis will not be considered in the analysis.

# **4.3.** Analysis of the Occurrences of Translation Errors in *A Game of Thrones*

First of all, this piece of research is concerned with creating a tool for translation error analysis – not revision – by using the parameters presented in the translation revision model created by Brian Mossop in 2001. For this, I decided to select some chapters of *A Game of Thrones* instead of working with the whole book. Also, since the parameters are used in the present study as categories of a tool for the analysis of translation errors, I chose to refer to them, from now on, as categories instead of parameters.

Thus, from the 73 chapters of *A Game of Thrones*, 11 were analysed. From these 11 chapters, 129 occurrences of translation errors were found. From these 129, 98 were classified according to 6 of the categories extracted from Mossop's Model – as shown in Table 2 – and 31 occurrences of a similar nature that have no equivalent category in the model. As a consequence, a new category had to be created for them: Consistency, which is discussed in detail further on, in section 4.3.7. The 6 categories I found corresponding translation errors are listed below.

Table 2: Occurrences of Translation Errors according to Mossop's Model

| Categories   | Number of Occurrences |
|--------------|-----------------------|
| Idiom        | 38                    |
| Accuracy     | 35                    |
| Smoothness   | 13                    |
| Completeness | 7                     |
| Logic        | 3                     |
| Mechanics    | 2                     |
| TOTAL:       | 98                    |

Idiom was the category with the highest number of the translation errors, with 38 occurrences. Next, with 35 occurrences, is Accuracy. After Accuracy, the categories with most occurrences of translation error were Smoothness and Completeness, with 13 and 7, respectively. Finally, with 3 and 2 occurrences of translation errors each were Logic and Mechanics, respectively. Each one of the categories is discussed in detail in separate sections, respecting the presentation order of the parameters in Mossop's model, i.e. the same order used in Table 2.

Finally, each category is represented by an example of occurrence of translation error in its own section, and all occurrences can be found in the Appendix section, with the number of lines corresponding to the alignment of both EN-US and PT-BR texts available at www.copa-trad.ufsc.br. Furthermore, the main terms analyzed are presented in **bold-face** form, and the complementary terms for the analysis are underlined.

# **4.3.1.** Accuracy

As explained previously, Accuracy is the first parameter presented in Mossop's model and also the second category with the highest number of occurrences of translation error: **35**. That is, **35** of the 98 excerpts with translation errors analyzed of the book *A Game of Thrones* are due to lack of Accuracy. I discuss each one of them below.

**#01** Line #98 describes the color of a sentinel tree a character is climbing. It is described as grey-green, whereas grey is used

to refer to the hue of green. However, in the PT-BR version, the sentinel tree's characteristic was translated as if the tree had been described as green-grey ("cinzenta esverdeada"). An inversion of the words in the description occurred, thus lacking in accuracy and changing the color of the tree in the PT-BR translation.

- #02 The same occurred with line #107, which once again presents the colors of the sentinel tress, this time reflected on the armor of a character.
- #03 The next case of lack of Accuracy is line #120. The scene focus on the contrast of body-temperature warm blood behaving like steam when it contact with the air of a very cold environment after a character is attacked and pierced through his chainmail with a sword. The emphasis on how cold the place was and how hot the blood was is very important to the scene, as to draw a line between dead/living. In addition, to reinforce this contrast, the color of blood fallen on the snow is compared to fire. In PT-BR, on the other hand, this contrast was lost once it was translated as "correu ao frio", i.e. "it flowed in the cold", without showing the reader the importance of this contrast and its implication in the story.
- #04 As to line #126, it describes several characters behaving the same way, by performing the same moving at the same time: "The watchers moved forward together (...)". Even so, the PT-BR describes this action as if the watchers had walked towards one another, moved closer: "Os observadores aproximaram-se uns dos outros (...)", which not only conveys the same meaning as the ST, but also creates ambiguity in the scene and other implications.
- #05 The line #152 explains that the wind had died at the moment of the scene, but, according to the translation, the very opposite occurred: "(...) embora o vento tivesse caído (...)" ("though the wind started to blow").
- #06 Line #153 is similar to lines #98 and #107. It uses colors to make the description of a Robb Stark's hair: "red-brown hair" and, once again, the PT-BR translation inverts the colors by describing the hair as "vermelho-acastanhados" (brown-red).

- #07 Line #256 presents the same case as lines #98, #107 and #153: the inversion of "grey-green" in EN-US to "cinza-esverdeadas" ("green-grey") in the description of sentinel trees in the PT-BR.
- #08 As to line #261, it brings the description of three different places: the South, the Isle of Faces and the place where the character of the chapter is, which is the North. This excerpt uses the sentence "Up here it was different" to contrast that both South and the Isle are different from the North. However, in the PT-BR translation this sentence was incorporated to the description of the Isle "(...) e as coisas eram silenciosas" –, and therefore lost its function and the implication to the scene. The location of the character no longer was the most different of the three.
- #09 Line #273 presents, perhaps, one of the most distorted translation errors due to lack of accuracy. Here the character Ned Stark talks about a man who was sentenced to die and admits how brave it was of him to accept his fate: "The man died well, I'll give him that (...)". But, when it comes to the PT-BR version, the result was that Ned assured the character he was talking to that the man was killed, perhaps, in a way that could be considered "clean" in spite of his crime: "O homem morreu bem, posso lhe assegurar (...)".
- **#10** Line #331 brings another inversion of words when describing a color. "Blue-grey mountains" became "montanhas azulacinzentadas" ("blue-grey mountains") in the TT.
- #11 Before I discuss line #334, I would like to emphasize that although *A Game of Thrones* is a fantasy novel (e.g. fiction), their time measurement units are the exact same of our reality. Also, different from metric units, both USA and Brazil use the same time units: days, hours, minutes, and so on. Based on that, line #334 informs that the character Daenerys Targaryen was born "nine moons" after an event took place.

**Table 3: Occurrence of Accuracy** 

| Line<br># | North American English  | Brazilian Portuguese   |
|-----------|---|--|
| 334       | She had been born on Dragonstone <b>nine moons</b> after their flight, () | Nascera em Pedra do Dragão <b>quatro</b> luas depois da fuga, () |

In the PT-BR translation, "nine moons" were transformed into "four moons": "quatro luas". This piece of information does not need contextualization to be understood or any kind of conversion, and therefore there is no justification for such lack of accuracy in the translation.

#12 In line #343 once again we have an excerpt about Daenerys Targaryen, which is known for her "silver-pale hair" (as in the description) and lilac eyes. However, in the PT-BR translation her hair was described as white ("cabelos esbranquiçados").

In addition, this change in the description of the TT created an ambiguity in the excerpt. White/gray/grizzly hairs are associated to age and Daenerys is very young. The ST tells that old woman washed Deanery's hair, whereas the TT gives the idea that the old woman washed her hair instead of Deanery's: "A mulher mais velha lavou seus longos cabelos esbranquiçados (...)"

- **#13** Line #377 cites "bravos and sell swords" in EN-US, whereas the translation cites "sicários e mercenários". "Sicário" in Brazilian Portuguese means hitman or hired assassin, that is, synonyms for "mercenário". "Bravos", on the other hand, is not a synonym for "sell swords", nor has the same connotation.
- #14 Line #382 is a utterance made by Daenerys: ""What is he doing here?", she blurted", a question spat after being caught in surprise by spotting a knight who was not supposed to be in the same place. Nonetheless, the PT-BR translation changed "she blurted" to "ela perguntou" ("she asked"), consequently removing the character's surprise and turning it into a simple and ambiguous question, as if asking about his function or actions at the event.

#15 The case in line #481 could be also considered, perhaps, an occurrence of Idiom, for it seems to present a term which is not common in Brazilian Portuguese. However, since this study deals with translation errors and thus the ST has to be taken into account, this line is classified as Accuracy for presenting a case in which TT did not convey the same message of the ST.

The ST says that "They all want something (...)", and right afterwards defines "something" as "money, or land or justice". "Something" in PT-BR means "alguma coisa", that is, it can be specified. On the other hand, "Qualquer coisa" in EN-US means "anything", that is, nothing specific.

This excerpt contains the King's account on the lies his people tell in order to get their money, land or justice. However, according to the Brazilian Portuguese translation, the excerpt gives the idea that his people will be satisfied as long as they get money, land, justice or any other thing.

- #16 As to line #492, the ST describes the action of the character Ned Stark standing on one knee, "(...) his eyes upraised", i.e. looking at a person standing in front of him while on his knee. But, when it comes to the translation, he is no longer described as looking at the person and a new detail was added to the scene: Ned is described as continuing on his knee, but without joy in his eyes ("(...) sem alegria nos olhos").
- #17 Line #506 presents an interesting case: the word "grey" was mistaken for "great" by the translator. As a result, "grey stone walls" was turned into "grandes paredes de pedra" in the PT-BR translation, that is, "great stone walls".
- #18 Line #507 is from a chapter with Jon Snow's point of view. In this excerpt, Jon and his siblings are at a feast and the scene describes where they were seated. ST and TT differ as to where they were put. According to the ST, they were seated beneath the raised platform where their parents and also their King and Queen were. However, in the TT, they are described as seating under ("por baixo") this platform.

- #19 Line #529 presents the seventh case of inversion of hue/color in descriptions. This excerpt talks about the color of Benjen Stark's eyes. The Stark family is known for a few striking features, such as living in the coldest place of the story and having blue-grey eyes often described as being as cold as the place they live, thanks to their color grey with hues of blue –, which resembles ice or snow. In the same way, the Targaryen family as mentioned before in Deanery's description –, has lilac eyes and silver hair as striking features. However, the PT-BR translation presented this inversion of hue/color which made an outstanding feature such as blue-grey eyes become common blue with hints of grey ("olhos azuis-acinzentados").
- #20 One of the most impressive features in *A Game of Thrones* is that according to what characters are put through throughout the story children often behave like grown-up adults, with corresponding deeds. That is the case of line #547 Jon Snow's utterance –, telling that Daeren Targaryen was only fourteen when he conquered one of the main cities of the story. On the other hand, according to the translation, Daeren was a little bit older when he did it: "tinha só quinze anos" (was only fifteen).
- #21 As to line #578, it describes the action of Tyrion Lannister trying to make first contact with a direwolf by reaching out to pet it. However, his attempt is not welcomed by the creature, which draws back and snarls silently at him. According to the PT-BR translation, this attempt of touching the creature was transformed into an attempt of playing with the direwolf: "(...) o anão estendeu a mão para lhe fazer uma festa, (...)" (the dwarf reached out to play with him).

This case is classified as Accuracy once the actions of "to pet" and "to play with" have different meanings and responses. "To pet" involves an active person and a passive direwolf, which receives the action; whereas "to play with" involves an active person and an active direwolf, which is stimulated and reacts to the stimuli by playing with in return. Therefore, the ST does not convey the same meaning of the ST.

#22 Line #592 is an excerpt of an important conversation between Jon Snow and Tyrion Lannister with, perhaps, far reaching implications to the story. Both characters are bastards, in other words, they were both conceived within illegitimate unions. Jon Snow is a young boy that is not used to people calling him bastard and gets hurt

whenever someone does it. Tyrion Lannister, on the other hand, is an older man that not only got used to people reminding him of this origin and the fact that he is a dwarf, but also accepts it and uses this acceptance as a "shield". In this conversation, Tyrion advises Jon not to forget that he is a bastard – and also accept it –, for people will not forget it and will also try to use it against him. Unfortunately, this excerpt lost its meaning and importance in the TT, for it was translated as "(...) porque é certo que o mundo não se lembrará" (for surely the world will not remember).

This case apparently could be considered as an occurrence of Logic, for taking the context into account the translation presents contradiction: in case people forgot Jon Snow and Tyrion Lannister are bastards, they would not have to worry about people trying to intimidate them or hurt their feelings.

However, in spite of the ambiguity, the sentence alone in the translation – without considering the source text – does make sense. Out of context his advice would mean that Jon Snow is just another person in the world, thus having to keep in mind who he is and his value as well. Therefore, no insult would take effect.

Taking that into consideration, line #592 is classified as Accuracy, for it lacked accuracy when conveying the true meaning of Tyrion Lannister's advice to Jon Snow.

#23 Line #602 brings the description of the Catelyn Stark's bathroom, after telling the reader that although she lives in the coldest city of the story her bedchambers and bathroom are always hot, since these parts of the castle were built over natural hot springs and their water rushes through the walls.

However, the TT translated "Catelyn's bath" as "O banho de Catelyn" (the act of bathing) and also turning "(...) and her walls warm to the touch" as a consequence of bathing in such hot and steaming water. As it is possible to see, the TT does not present ambiguity, but does not express the understanding of the ST.

#24 Line #693 includes a very common way of cursing people in the story. In this case, Ned Stark is talking to Catelyn Stark, his wife, which advises him to "save" a friend from the Lannister family, despite the consequences. Hence he curses her and his friend. In the PT-BR Translation, however, Ned curses his wife and the Lannister,

as if turning down her request and meaning that he is not worried about his friend: "Que os Outros levem os dois" (The Others take them).

- #25 Line #698 continues line #693. Ned Stark accepted his wife's request and, as a consequence, explains to Catelyn that she will have to govern the north in his stead, while he will be far away, responsible for his friend's obligations. However, in the PT-BR translation, he says he will be dealing with his friend's messages ("(...) enquanto trato dos recados de Robert").
- #26 As to line #784, here there are two characters: Arya Stark and her direwolf, Nymeria. Arya commands Nymeria to go with her, and the direwolf is described as following Arya right away, close to her. The TT text, on the other hand, describes Nymeria as following Arya and also biting her heels ("(...) com a loba a morder-lhe os calcanhares").
- #27 Line #816 of the ST describes Prince Tommen rolling in the dust after falling down for drilling with other boys in the yard. In the TT, Tommen is described as lying around in the dust ("rebolava"), which has a complete different meaning in PT-BR.
- #28 Line #865 tells the story of two brothers who died "(...) on one another's sword (...) in the war the singers called the Dance of the Dragons". Singer, in the context of *A Game of Thrones*, is a synonym for bards, who spread stories orally, through music, not in the written form, as poets do. However, in the PT-BR version "singers" was translated as "poetas" (poets), hence changing the way story of the two brothers was passed on.
- #29 Line #866 presents the description of the character Ser Meryn by telling he "(...) had droopy eyes and a beard of the color of rust". However, the PT-BR translation presents an ambiguous description of the feature of his eyes. The term "droopy eyes" was translated as "olhos inclinados" (inclined eyes). This term is not clear as to whether they are inclined downward, as in the source text, or upward, as most of the oriental eyes.
- #30 Line #901 concerns a couple talking about being careful with someone they do not trust: "We will have to watch him

- carefully (...)". However, in the translation the utterance was changed to "Teremos de vigiá-los cuidadosamente" (We will have to watch them carefully), that is, from second-person singular to second-person plural, with no apparent reason.
- #31 Line #910 brings an excerpt of a conversation where two characters talk about a decision made by a third person and its possible implications in their lives: "When he had already agreed to (...)". However, in PT-BR line #910 presents a translation error very similar to that of Accuracy #31. It switches from second-person singular to first-person plural: "Depois de já termos concordado (...)" (When we have already agreed to), and hence not being faithful to the ST.
- #32 Line #1015 brings a dialog between two characters. Cersei Lannister comments that she does not wish any direwolf near her children, but since the creatures are bond to their owners Stark girls that were going to live with the Lannister family for a while Tyrion Lannister tells her, "You'll have a hard time stopping them, sister. They follow these girls everywhere". However, in the TT his opinion was changed from second-person singular to first-person plural: "Teremos dificuldades em impedi-los de ir, irmã" (We will have a hard time stopping them, sister).
- #33 Line #1045 is an excerpt of the account of Catelyn Stark, who stayed by her son's side following his recovery after he climbed and fell of a tower and survived. "She had her meals brought to her there, and chamber pots as well, and a small hard bed to sleep on, tough it was said she has scarcely slept at all". "Chamber pots" were translated as "banhos" (baths/bathing) in PT-BR, thus not offering the reader the same description of the ST.
- #34 Line #1154 presents the exact same case as line #377 in translation error of Accuracy #13, which presents term "bravos" translated as "sicários".
- #35 Line #1172 brings the excerpt of Deanery Targaryen and Khal Drogo's wedding. They were seated upon an earthen ramp "(...) above the seething sea of Dothraki", which is Khal Drogo's people. However, according to the PT-BR translation, they were seated upon the guests: "(...) sobre o fervente mar de dothrakis".

After 35 occurrences of Accuracy, it is possible to conclude that, in the PT-BR translation, most of the occurrences influenced on the outcome of actions, changed several descriptions and therefore their implications, and other many situations.

As to actions, the occurrences explored in the present study proved to change, from the ST to the TT, for example, the behavior of characters before a given situation, the behavior of blood and wind in scenes with tension, a reaction to a proposal with far reaching implications in the story, different reactions to a command, and also different actions or reactions that included more people in TT than they had included in ST.

The second kind of translation errors due to lack of Accuracy with most of the occurrences were related to hues/colors in descriptions. Three of these translation errors were about sentinel trees; two about characters' hair, Robb Stark's and Daenerys Targaryen's, the latter also resulting in a accidental change of roles in the excerpt; one about scenery, the color of mountains; and the last one about a character's eyes, Benjen Stark's.

Also, some of the description problems due to lack of Accuracy included changes in the description of a character's feature, such as Ser Meryn's droopy eyes, which became inclined ones in the TT; description of objects, such as a grey wall which became great wall in the TT; a place turned into object; an object turned into action; also the place were some characters were seated in a given event, in these occurrences, where Jon Snow's sibling where seated at a feast and where Daenerys Targaryen and Khal Drogo were seated at their wedding; and changing in period of time and character's age as well.

# 4.3.2. Completeness

As mentioned before, Completeness is the second parameter presented in Mossop's model and the fourth category with the highest number of occurrences of translation error: **7**. Each one of them is discussed below.

#01 Line #15 describes the sympathy of one character – Will – for another one that is going through the same unpleasant situation he had gone through many times. In the ST, the excerpt tells what happened to Will after he first when through it and that "He had laughed about it afterward". The TT does not contain this sentence

regarding his reaction after recalling the outcome of the situation, thus removing the part that shows to the reader that Will got over it.

- #02 Line #196 is part of scene told by Bran Stark's point of view when he and his family found direwolf puppies. The PT-BR translation of line #196 removed the piece of information of the ST that told Robb Stark was cradling the direwolf puppy as it tried to search for milk among his leathers.
- #03 Part of the description of the coldest city in A Game of Thrones Winterfell is provided by line #256 through Catelyn Stark's point of view. She gives a rich description of the woods of Winterfell and also describes the castle she lives in as gloomy a result of being built around "(...) three acres of old forest untouched for ten thousand years (...)". However, the PT-BR translation does not provide the adjective to describe the castle, hence removing the contribution to the image of a place which differs greatly from that she grew up in and her resulting discomfort as well.
- #04 Line #331 is a Daenerys Targaryen's memory of her brother's words Viserys about their family's land Westeros and how it still belongs to them even after their family was cast out during war. Daenerys remembers Viserys saying "Ours by blood right, taken from us by treachery, but ours still, ours forever (...)". The PT-BR translation removed the part in which he said Westeros is theirs forever either way, thus eliminating Viserys's refusal to accept that they no longer live and are in command of Westeros.
- #05 Line #453 is an excerpt of a conversation between Robert Baratheon and Ned Stark, the king and the Lord of the North, but more than that, old friends. Robert gets tired of Ned's politeness towards him while talking about important matters and complains about it. After Ned agrees with Robert, the text implies that the subsequent silent left room for Ned to change the subject and ask Robert about his sincere opinion on a serious matter. The PT-BR translation, on the other hand, does not contain this transition between subjects and roles between the two characters.

#06 Line #465 continues the conversation between Robert and Ned. This time, the ST describes Robert laughing, the sound of his laugh echoing and reverberating on the ceiling.

**Table 4: Occurrence of Completeness** 

| Line # | North American English  | Brazilian Portuguese  |
|--------|---|---|
| 465    | Robert laughed, the sound rattling among the tombs and bouncing from the vaulted ceiling. His smile was a flash of white teeth in the thicket of the huge black beard. "Ah, Ned," he said, "you are still too serious." | Robert soltou uma<br>gargalhada, fazendo o som<br>chocalhar por entre as<br>sepulturas e ressoar no teto<br>abobadado Ah, Ned,<br>continua sério demais |

To create a contrast with the image of a serious king, the excerpt tells "[h]is smile was a flash of white teeth in the thicket of the huge black beard" – another contrast as well, to emphasize his smile. However, the TT does not contain this description of Robert's smile.

#07 Line #623 describes Ned Stark turning away from his wife, Catelyn Stark, after a tense conversation and standing in the darkness, staring out through the window. "He stood staring out in the darkness (...)" reflects the impact of the conversation on Ned, and is also a bridge to next Catelyn Stark's action. However, The PT-BR translation does not contain this sentence emphasizing Ned's nuisance.

After analysing the 7 occurrences of Completeness it is possible to point out that the parts missing in the excerpt include: characters' reactions to a situation or conversation, such as Will demonstrating by a reaction that he had overcome a situation and Ned being shocked by the conversation with his wife; description of a place, as when Catelyn Stark compares the castle she lives in with the one she lived, justifying her discomfort; a character's emphasis and denial, as when Viserys Targaryen makes it clear that Westeros is his family's rightful land; and also the contrast when shifting between two roles of the same character, such as Robert Baratheon's laughing signaling he had switched from the role of King to friend when talking to Ned Stark.

These parts missing in the PT-BR translation might not seem as important as they are if one reads the translation without comparing it to the source text. However, considering the brief created for this study – the fact that Jorge Candeias tried to translate respecting George R. R. Martin's writing style and be as close as possible to Martin's words – such lack Completeness fail to convey some subtleties and important features of the characters in *A Game of Thrones*.

## 4.3.3. Logic

Logic is the third parameter presented in Mossop's model and the second category with the lowest number of occurrences of translation error: **3**. I discuss them in detail below.

- #01 The first occurrence of translation error due to lack of Logic, line #114, includes three characters: a battle between the Other and Ser Waymar, and Will, which is watching them fight and hoping that Ser Waymar Royce could overcome the Other. This excerpt tells that the Other fixed his eyes on the longsword being held high by Ser Waymar. Even though the later was trembling, the act of the Other coming into a halt and staring at the sword made Will hope that his fellow could win the match. However, the PT-BR translation says that Will fixed his eyes on the sword not the Other –, thus transforming the Other's hesitation and Will's hope into nonsense.
- #02 The second occurrence of Logic, line #950, tells that Tyrion Lannister stayed up late reading, and "His reading lamp was flickering, its oil all but gone, as dawn light leaked through the high windows".

**Table 5: Occurrence of Logic** 

| Line # | North American English  | Brazilian Portuguese  |
|--------|---|---|
| 950    | His reading lamp was flickering, its oil all but gone, as <b>dawn</b> <u>light</u> leaked through the high windows. | Sua lanterna de leitura<br>bruxuleava, com o óleo quase<br>gasto, enquanto <u>a luz da</u><br><b>madrugada</b> se esgueirava<br>pelas janelas elevadas. |

However, in the TT there is a difference between dawn and the moment before the dawn, which is still dark. For the former, it is "amanhecer" in PT-BR; and, for the latter, "madrugada". In the translation this excerpt makes no sense, once dawn was translated as "madrugada". Therefore, it is impossible to have light leaking trough the windows.

#03 The third and last occurrence of Logic, line #1239, is an excerpt of a scene with Khal Drogo and Daenerys Targaryen after they got married. The scene describes Khal Drogo caressing Daenerys little by little. As line #1239 describes, he started to caress her "[1]ightly at first, then harder. When it comes to the PT-BR translation, "lightly" was transformed into "ligeiramente", which is the same word in EN-US, but has an entire other meaning in PT-BR. "Ligeiramente" can be translated as "quickly" or "fast", words that do not describe intensity, let alone justify the use of the comparative "harder". As a result, the translation makes no sense, once it describes Khal Drogo touching Daenerys very quick at first, then harder.

After analysing the 3 occurrences of Logic, it is possible to conclude that translation errors due to lack of Logic not only introduce nonsense in the translated text, but also can take away the importance of an act, or of a whole scene.

The first occurrence of Logic presented a case in which an action was attributed to another character, thus getting into disagreement with the rest of the scene. The second occurrence brought a problem of possible translations for the word "dawn", thus resulting in a impossible scene in PT-BR. The third and last occurrence also presented nonsense when describing a scene with caressing.

### 4.3.4. Smoothness

Smoothness is the fifth parameter presented in Mossop's model and the third category in this study with the highest number of occurrences of translation error: 13. They are discussed below.

#01 The first occurrence of translation error due to lack of Smoothness is line #67. After Gared stated that there was something wrong in the place they were, Ser Waymar Royce asked, "Is there?". This question was translated to PT-BR as "Aí há?", which is, basically,

"careless imitation of the word order" (Mossop, 2001, p. 106) of the ST. This sentence structure is not used in PT-BR.

- #02 The second occurrence of Smoothness, line #110, is an excerpt of a fight between a human and a creature known as Other. This line specifically describes the sword wielded by the Other and its faint blue light shimmering around its edges. In the ST, the word "edges" was translated as "limites", which is one of the possible translations and perhaps the first one that comes to mind when translating the word literally and/or out of context. However, taking the context into account, "limites" is not applicable.
- #03 The third occurrence of Smoothness, line #281, is a Catelyn Stark's commentary on the creatures living beyond the Wall she had heard about. She said, "There are darker things beyond the Wall".

**Table 6: Occurrence of Smoothness** 

| Line # | North American English                                      | Brazilian Portuguese   |
|--------|---|--|
| 281    | "There are <b>darker</b> <u>things</u><br>beyond the Wall." | - Há <u>coisas</u> <b>mais escuras</b> para<br>lá da Muralha |

In the PT-BR translation, the comparative "darker" was translated as "mais escuras". This translation would have been correct in case Catelyn had been describing the color of these "things", these creatures, beyond the Wall. Unfortunately, that is not the case. Catelyn described the creatures in terms of being more dangerous than what she and her husband – the one she talked to in this excerpt – are used to.

#04 Line #330 is an excerpt of the description of the city Pentos through the character's Daenerys Targaryen point of view. She says that, from her window, she could hear "(...) the shouts of ragged children playing games beyond the walls of the estate".

When it comes to PT-BR, the translation presents a "careless imitation of the word order" (Mossop, 2001, p. 106) of the original text. "Esfarrapadas" is one of the possible translations for "ragged" and so is "jogavam" for "playing games". However, both seem to have been translated separate from the text, i.e. out of context, for although the

sentence is comprehensible to the Brazilian reader, its lexical is awkward and it is possible to grasp the original wording of the EN-US through it.

"Jogavam", in this context, means that the kids were throwing something beyond the walls – not that they were playing outside the city walls –, however, the reader is able to understand the real meaning of the sentence once the text does not say what the children would be throwing outside the walls.

- #05 Another occurrence of Smoothness, line #713, is about Ned Stark leaving Winterfell and taking his children with him to the capital. Catelyn Stark, his wife, would remain in Winterfell without her kids. For her comprehension, Ned thanks her and says, "This is hard, I know". Once again, in the PT-BR translation, there is a "careless imitation of the word order" (Mossop, 2001, p. 106) of the original text, which gives the impression of literal translation, without taking the context into account: "Isto é duro, bem sei".
- **#06** The case of line #738 is similar to that of line #713. The sentence "A hard sacrifice" of the ST was translated as "É um sacrifício duro".
- #07 Another occurrence of Smoothness yet in line #738, and also presenting the same problem as the previous one and line #713. "Yet these are hard times, my lord" of the ST was translated as "Mas estes são tempos duros, senhor".
- #08 The eighth occurrence of Smoothness, line #898, is an excerpt of a conversation between Jaime and Cersei Lannister about Robert Baratheon and Ned Stark. Cersei says, "Robert will listen to Stark". This sentence in PT-BR was translated as "Robert escutará Stark". The translation is correct and so is the word order, however, citing Ned Stark without the define article and only using his surname gives the impression that Robert will listen to any Stark family member, and not specifically Ned.
- #09 The second occurrence in line #898 presents the same problem as the previous occurrence. "(...) I was certain Stark would refuse him" was translated as "(...) tinha certeza de que Stark lhe diria não".

- **#10** Line #917 is the third occurrence of Smoothness concerning the use of family names without definite article, as the two cases of line #898. "Having Stark beside him will only make him worse" was translated as "Stark a seu lado só o fará ficar pior".
- #11 Line #935 is part of a conversation between Cersei and Jaime Lannister. They could not be spotted together. As soon as the boy Bran Stark sees them together, Cersei panics and says, "He saw us". Jaime replies, "So he did". His answer was translated into PT-BR as "Pois viu", which is European Portuguese wording, specifically, and is also a literal translation. As a consequence, this sentence is awkward to the Brazilian reader.
- #12 Line #1140 presents a case of typical PT-PT wording as well. This is an excerpt of the conversation between the characters Jon Snow and his stepbrother, before Jon left Winterfell to travel to the Wall. Jon says, "I better go. I'll spend my first year on the Wall emptying chamber pots if I keep Uncle Ben waiting any longer". In the PT-BR version, "emptying chamber pots" was translated as "a despejar penicos". "A despejar" is a typical PT-PT wording, not used in PT-BR, thus the reading not flowing naturally for the Brazilian reader.
- #13 Line #1172 is part of the description of Daenerys Targaryen's marriage to Khal Drogo. Through her point of view, the people at their ceremony are described as drinking wine and spitting jests at each other. When it comes to the PT-BR translation, the term "jests" was translated as "ditos de espírito". Although the translation is correct and "ditos de espírito" is one of the possible translations for "jests", the reading is not smooth to the Brazilian reader. This term does not feel natural in PT-BR nor does it fit the context in which the term is used.

After analysing the 13 occurrences of translation error due to lack of Smoothness, it is possible to point out that 6 of them (occurrences #02, #03, #04, #05, #06 and #07) can be considered literal translations; 3 of these occurrences (numbers #02, #03 and #04) and another one (occurrence #13) are also considered possible translations – not the proper ones for the context of the excerpts at hand, though.

Furthermore, it is interesting to point out that taking into account the context of investigation, i.e. that the present study deals with the translation of a EN-US text adapted to PT-BR after a PT-PT translation, 5 occurrences (#01, #08, #09, #10 and #11) are basically careless imitation of word order from the ST in the TT, and 3 occurrences (#01, #11 and #12) can be considered plain PT-PT wording. Moreover, as a Brazilian researcher I cannot say whether the occurrences with the word order imitated from the ST also present a PT-PT wording.

Taking these considerations into account, it is interesting to point out that according to the brief for this study these occurrences of imitated word order and PT-PT wording may not be considered translation errors at all. However, considering the method for analysis – which include as first reading the PT-BR translation without comparing it to the ST –, they are classified as occurrences of Smoothness, and therefore translation errors

#### 4.3.5. Idiom

Idiom is the eighth parameter in Mossop's translation revision model and the category with the highest number of occurrences in this study, with 38 occurrences. Each of them is discussed below.

- #01 The first occurrence of the category Idiom, line #14, describes Gared, a member of the Night's Watch, telling the reader that he spent forty years at its service, "man and boy". The translation, however, translated the term "man and boy" as "em homem e em rapaz". Although the translation is grammatically acceptable, the word combination is not common in Brazilian Portuguese.
- #02 The second occurrence of Idiom, line #30, is the description of Will of the scene he stumbled on while on watch: a few men and women lying like dead on the ground, with weapons nearby: "Some swords, a few bows". This sentence, however, was translated into PT-BR as "Algumas espadas, uns quantos arcos", which is acceptable according to the brief, but not common in PT-BR.
- #03 This occurrence continues the previous one, both in line #30. Will described a weapon he saw by the bodies lying on the ground: "Heavy-looking, double-bladed, a cruel piece of iron". In PT-

BR this sentence was translated as "Com ar de ser pesado, duas lâminas, um cruel bocado de ferro". Although the translation of this sentence is correct according to the brief and comprehensible to the Brazilian reader, the wording and the structure of the sentence – adjective before subject – is not common in PT-BR.

- #04 Line #36 continues the sequence of line #30 (occurrences #02 and #03). Ser Waymar Royce asked Will "You have a chill?" after Will described what he had seen at the camp the bodies lying still on the ground, without any blood and weapons lying around them and shivered involuntarily. The question Royce asked Will was translated as "Está enregelado?". The translation is comprehensible, but the wording is not common in PT-BR.
- #05 The fifth occurrence of Idiom, line #65, involves three characters: Will, Gared and Ser Waymar Royce. In this scene, they are all checking on the camp Will described in line #36. Gared says, "There's something wrong here". This statement was translated to PT-BR as "Há qualquer coisa de errado aqui". This sentence may be comprehensible to the Brazilian reader, however, that is not the correct translation once this is not how Brazilians would say. "Há qualquer coisa de errado aqui" (There's anything wrong here) makes no sense in PT-BR according to the context (it makes no sense in EN-US either) and certainly does not convey the same message of the ST.
- #06 After Gared had told his mates that there was something wrong where they were, Royce almost made fun of him. In line #68, this occurrence of Idiom, Gared asked his mate, "Can't you feel it?". This sentence was translated as "Não o sentiu?", that it, grammatically correct, comprehensible, but not used when someone is talking about something abstract, i.e. something one can feel, not see it or touch it.
- #07 Line #109 continues the scene of the previous occurrence, #06 (line #68). This time, Ser Waymar Royce sights the Other and he warns it to come no farther. "His voice cracked like a boy's". This sentence was translated literary to PT-BR, "A voz estava quebrada como a de um rapaz", and, if it were not for the context, it would be close to not making any sense in the TL.

- #08 Line #169 is about the death sentence of Gared. He was considered a deserter from the Night's Watch after fleeing the scene of the battle between the Other and Ser Waymar Royce. Ned Stark talks to his son, Bran, about the reason why Gared had to be killed: "(...) the man was an oath breaker, a deserter from the Night's Watch". The term "an oath breaker" was translated to PT-BR as "um insurreto". "Insurreto" may be translated to EN-US as "rebel" ("rebelde" in PT-BR). However, "insurreto" is not commonly used in PT-BR, and, despite the brief asserting that the translation should be as close as possible to George R.R. Martin's writing, this excerpt is about a conversation between father and son. Consequently, it has to be taken into account that the father would not talk formally to his son nor use a word that is not common and could interfere in his son's comprehension.
- #09 Line #177 occurs after Robb Stark found several direwolf puppies and Jon Snow calls Ned and Bran Stark to check what Robb had found. Ned tells one of his companions, Jory Cassel, "Come, let us see what mischief my sons have rooted out now". This sentence was translated as "Vamos, vamos ver que velhacaria desenterraram agora os meus filhos". The word "Velhacaria" is not used in PT-BR, the same goes to the term "(...) que velhacaria desenterraram". If it were not for the context, this passage might have been incomprehensible to the Brazilian reader.
- #10 Line #197 presents a typical PT-PT way of saying. In this excerpt, Robb Stark holds a direwolf pup and encourages Bran Stark to touch it: "Go on (...) You can touch him". Robb's speech was translated to PT-BR as "Vá lá (...) Pode tocá-lo". "Vá lá", although understandable and perfectly grammatical, is an unidiomatic combination in PT-BR for the present context.
- #11 Line #204 presents the same kind of translation error of occurrence #05 (line #65), which translated "something" in "There's something in the throat (...)" of the ST to "qualquer coisa" in "Há qualquer coisa na garganta (...)" in the TT. Once again, although "qualquer coisa", in this case, may be comprehensible to the reader, this still is an unidiomatic combination in PT-BR.

- #12 Line #237 brings Ned Stark stating part of the terms for his children to keep the direwolf pups they have found. He warned them that they would have to train the pups and be responsible for them. "These are not dogs to beg for treats and slink off at a kick", he said. When it comes to the PT-BR translation, the word "treats" was turned into "festas", as in "Esses não são cães que peçam festas ou se esquivem a um pontapé". "(...) [Q]ue peçam festas" is an unidiomatic combination in PT-BR when considering the context of the excerpt.
- #13 Line #285 is part of a conversation between Catelyn and Ned Stark. He says, in the ST, "You did not come here to tell me crib tales" and, in the TT, "Não veio até aqui me contar histórias de embalar". As described here, the term "crib tales" was translated as "histórias de embalar" in the PT-BR. Even though the translation is comprehensible, it is an unidiomatic combination.
- #14 Line #344 is about Daenerys Targaryen been promised to marry Khal Drogo. "She had always assumed that she would wed Viserys when she came of age", for Viserys is her brother and for centuries Targaryen had married sister to brother. "She had always assumed (...)" was translated to "Sempre assumira (...)", which is a literal translation, and therefore acceptable. However, this is an unidiomatic combination.
- #15 Line #415 is part of conversation between Robert Baratheon and Ned Stark about the deceased sister of the latter, Lyanna Stark. Robert says to Ned, "Take me down to your crypt, Eddard. I would pay my respects".

Table 7: Occurrence of Idiom

| Line # | North American English        | Brazilian Portuguese        |
|--------|-------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| 415    | "Take me down to your crypt,  | - Leve-me à sua cripta,     |
|        | Eddard. I would <b>pay</b> my | Eddard. Quero apresentar os |
|        | respects."                    | meus respeitos.             |

The sentence "I would pay my respects" was translated to "Quero apresentar os meus respeitos" (I would present my respects) in PT-BR.

Apart from context, this translation might be confusing to the reader, once it is an unidiomatic combination very close to the literal translation of the ST.

- #16 Line #441 continues the same conversation of the previous occurrence of Idiom. This time, Robert expresses his refusal to accept Lyanna's fate by saying to Ned, "She should be on a hill somewhere, under a fruit tree, with the son and clouds above her and the rain to wash her clean". In this case, the occurrence of Idiom regards the term "fruit tree", translated to PT-BR as "árvore de fruto" (tree of fruit), which is understandable to the Brazilian reader, but is an unidiomatic combination as well.
- #17 Line #469 is also continues the conversation between Robert and Ned. This time Robert comments that Ned must have wondered why he had come North to visit Ned. As answer, ""[f]or the joy of my company, surely", he said lightly". The last part of the answer, "he said lightly", was translated as "com ligeireza", one of the possible translations for "lightly", however, not a common term in PT-BR.
- #18 Line #506 is part of the chapter under Jon Snow's point of view in which he is at a feast in Winterfell. Jon notices that the voice of the singer at the hall "(...) could scarcely be heard above the roar of the fire, the clangor of pewter plates and cups, and the low mutter of a hundred drunken conversations". The part of the sentence "Pewter plates and cups" was translated to PT-BR as "pratos e taças de peltre". "Peltre" is not a common word for "pewter" in the TL.
- #19 Line #516 continues the previous occurrence of Idiom, in which Jon Snow is at a feast in Winterfell. This time, the scene tells that "[a]fter all had been seated, toasts were made, thanks were given and returned, and then the feasting began". The term "feasting" was translated as "festim", which is not commonly used in PT-BR.
- #20 Line #625 occurs after a conversation between Catelyn and Ned Stark, when a third character knocks on their door. "Ned turned, frowning" was turned into "Ned virou-se, franzindo o olho" in the TT. "Frowning" and "franzindo o olho" (squinting) have different meanings, especially according to the context. This way, this could be considered an occurrence of Accuracy. However, considering the

methodology of the present study – reading the translation alone before making the comparison between ST and TT –, it becomes clear what the translation meant "frowning". This considerer, this is an occurrence of Idiom, for "franzindo o olho" is not common in PT-BR.

- #21 Line #658 is about Catelyn Stark receiving a letter and being afraid of the news it brought. "She reached out and took the letter in trembling hands". "Trembling hands" were translated into PT-BR as "mãos trementes". Although Jorge Candeias tried to translate as close as possible to the ST and "trementes" is comprehensible for the Brazilian reader, it is an unidiomatic combination, and therefore, not applicable for Brazilian readers.
- #22 Line #794 makes part of the chapter under Arya Stark's point of view. She was watching her brother, Bran Stark, and Prince Tommen drilling. According to her, "[t]hey were huffing and puffing and hitting at each other with padded wooden swords (...)". The term "huffing" was translated as "fanfarronavam" (to gasconade). Although this translation is correct, this term is not common in PT-BR.
- #23 Lines #813 continues the previous occurrence of Idiom, line #794. Arya Stark is talking to Jon Snow, her stepbrother, and she amuses herself imagining what it would be like to wed Tully (a trout) to Stark (a direwolf) in her arms: ""A wolf with a fish in its mouth? It made her laugh. "That would look silly"". "That would look silly" was translated to "Pareceria disparatado". Although this translation is understandable, it is an unidiomatic combination.
- #24 Line #862 presents the same translation error of occurrence #19, line #526. This occurrence of Idiom is the result of "festim" as a translation for "feast".
- #25 Line #868 occurs under Bran Stark's point of view, before moving from Winterfell to King's Landing. Bran was not enjoying his farewells, so "[i]nstead Bran spent the morning alone in the godswood, trying to teach his wolf to fetch a stick, and failing". "Instead" was translated as "Em lugar delas", which is almost the mixing of two PT-BR idiomatic combinations, thus resulting in an unidiomatic one

- #26 Line #911 along with lines #65, 204 and 481 present the same translation error of Idiom. In this case, Jaime Lannister says to Cersei Lannister that "(...) birthday does something to your minds. You are all mad". However, "something" was turning into the unidiomatic combination of "qualquer coisa".
- #27 Line #980 is part of the chapter under Tyrion Lannister's point of view. The character is a dwarf and in this excerpt he is looking at one of the tallest characters in the story: Sander Clegane. "A shadow fell across his face. He turned to find Clegane looming overhead like a cliff". The word "cliff" was translated to "falésia", which, among the possible translations, is one of the less used of them.
- #28 Line #1013 presents the same case as occurrences #05, #11, #15 and #26 (lines #65, 204, 481 and 911, respectively). In this excerpt, Cersei Lannister comments that "There is something unnatural about those animals", i.e. the Stark's direwolves. "Something" was, once again, translated as "qualquer coisa", which is not an idiomatic combination in PT-BR.
- #29 Line #1068 brings Catelyn Stark's blurting how she had "(...) prayed seven times to the seven faces of god that Ned would change his mind and leave (...)" Bran Stark with her in Winterfell, instead of bringing Bran along to King's landing. In the PT-BR translation, "the seven faces of god" was translated as "os sete rostos de deus". In PT-BR, whenever a god is described as having more than one personality/face, "rostos" is not the most common word.
- #30 Line #1080 describes some actions regarding the travel from Winterfell to the Wall. "Wagons were being loaded, men were shouting, horses were being harnessed and saddled and led from the stables". As to the translation error, the word "stables" was translated to PT-BR as "cavalariça", that among the possible translations it not so common.
- #31 Line #1095 is the farewell between Jon Snow and Robb Stark, before Jon left Winterfell and traveled to the Wall. Robb says, "Farewell, Snow". When it comes to the PT-BR version, "farewell" was translated as "Até a vista", which is an idiomatic combination in disuse long ago. As a reader, one could consider this translation as acceptable

in case Robb was an elder character. However, the brief has to be taken into account – i.e. the first reading of the TT should be made without making comparisons, checking for problems such as unidiomatic combinations or any hard-to-read/awkward sentences. As a result, the translation does not fit the context and, although it is comprehensible, it is not used in PT-BR anymore.

- #32 Line #1097 continues the previous occurrence, which is Jon Snow's response to Robb Stark's farewell. Jon answers, "And you, Stark", which was translated as "Até a vista, Stark". Once again, the translation is not appropriate considering the character's age and it is in disuse in PT-BR.
- #33 Line #1155 is part of a conversation including Viserys Targaryen, Magister Illyrio and Ser Jorah Mormont about the Daenerys Targaryen marriage with Khal Drogo. After Ser Jorah jested, "Magister Illyrio laughed lightly through his forked beard, but Viserys did not so much as smile". "[B]ut Viserys did not so much as smile" was translated as "mas Viserys nem sequer sorriu". Although the sentence is comprehensible to the reader, "nem sequer sorriu" is an unidiomatic combination.
- #34 Line #1184 is part of Daenerys Targaryen's marriage, more specifically, the moment when Khal Drogo signals that it is time for the bride gifts. He "(...) clapped his hands together, and the drums and the shouting and feasting came to a sudden halt". The same as in lines #516 and #862, this occurrence of Idiom deals the translation of "feasting" to "festim".
- #35 The second part of line #1184 brings the moment in which Khal Drogo stands and pulls Daenerys Targaryen to her feet beside him. "It was time for her bride gifts". When it comes to the PT-BR translation, this sentence was translated as "Tinha chegado o tempo dos seus presentes de noiva". Although comprehensible, "tinha chegado o tempo" is an unidiomatic combination.
- #36 Line #1190 describes one of the three dragon eggs Daenerys Targaryen got as a bride gift. "The last was black, as black as a midnight sea, yet alive with scarlet ripples and swirls". "Swirls" was

translated as "remoinhos", which may be a common word in PT-PT, but it is not in PT-BR.

- #37 Line #1203 describes the horse Khal Drogo gifted Daenerys Targaryen for their wedding. "She as a young filly, spirited and splendid. Dany knew just enough about horses to know that this was no ordinary animal". When it comes to the PT-BR translation, the second sentence was translated as "Dany sabia apenas o suficiente sobre cavalos para reconhecer que aquele não era um animal vulgar". "Animal vulgar" can be understood as a possible equivalent for "ordinary animal", however, "animal vulgar", in this case, is an unidiomatic combination.
- #38 Line #1203 also describes the horse Daenerys got as a wedding gift. "There was something about her that took the breath away". "Took the breath away" was translated to PT-BR as "cortava a respiração", which is comprehensible to reader when one takes the context into account. "Cortava a respiração", besides being a unidiomatic combination, is similar to an idiomatic combination which has another completely meaning and use.

It is interesting to point out that, from the 38 occurrences of translation error due to unidiomatic combinations, 34 are grammatically acceptable. Among all of the Idiom occurrences, only one (occurrence #14) is also considered a literal translation, 3 (occurrences #09, 15, and #18) can be considered incomprehensible without the context of the story, and 2 (occurrences #07 and #15) are almost incomprehensible to the reader, even with the context being taken into account.

#### 4.3.6. Mechanics

Mechanics is the ninth parameter presented in Mossop's model and the category with the lowest number of occurrences: only 2. Since this category does not deal with translation errors *per se*, but with errors such as spelling, grammar, usage or punctuation, I discuss the occurrences below explaining what would be the correct form and why.

#01 The first occurrence of Mechanics, line #336, brings the memory of Daenerys Targaryen and how Ser Willem Darry called her. "He called her "Little Princess" and sometimes "My Lady" (...)".

This excerpt was translated to PT-BR as "Chamava a "pequena princesa" e, por vezes, "minha senhora" (...)", that is, the hyphen in "Chamava a" is missing. "He called her" should have been translated as "Chamava-a".

#02 The second and last occurrence of Mechanics, line #488, presents a translation error of punctuation. The excerpt if part of the conversation between Robert Baratheon and Ned Stark, in which the former name the latter as Hand of the King. Robert says to Ned, "[i]f I wanted to honor you, I'll let you retire".

**Table 8: Occurrence of Mechanics** 

| Line # | North American English                        | Brazilian Portuguese                               |
|--------|---|--|
| 488    | If I wanted to honor you, I'd let you retire. | Se quisesse honrá-lo, deixaria que se aposentasse? |

This sentence, however, was translated to PT-BR as "Se quisesse honrálo, deixaria que se aposentasse?", with a question mark instead of period, thus changing the meaning of the sentence.

As explained above, the two occurrences of Mechanics presented a hyphenation problem and a punctuation one. It is interesting to point out that not always the meaning of the translated text is compromised by a translation error. It can also be altered by smaller details – but not less important – to the eye that sometimes go unnoticed even by an experienced translator or reviser.

## 4.3.7. New Category: Consistency

Given that I propose the use of Mossop's translation revision model as an analytical tool for translation errors and, as a consequence, it might result in some modification in the model, I decided to state right at the title of this subsection that by carrying out this research it was necessary to create a new category called Consistency.

Moreover, it is important to point out that Brian Mossop dedicated a whole chapter to "Checking for Consistency" in his book *Editing and Revising for Translators* (2001), the same in which he

presents his model for translation revision. However, even though the author talks about some possible features of consistency according to kind of translation at hand, consistency is not part of his model.

Furthermore, before I can discuss the translation errors categorized as Consistency, I would like to point that this study deals with a translation from the North American English to European Portuguese that has been adapted to Brazilian Portuguese and the resulting translation error problems. As a consequence, once different translations referrer to the same names, terms or words, I named these translations as "occurrences", and the names, terms or words as "cases".

That stated, I discuss below the **31** occurrences that compose the **8** cases of Consistency. They are so called: (i) "Winter is/was coming", with 4 occurrences; (ii) "Feet/Foot/Inches", with 6 occurrences; (iii) "Protector of the Realm", with 2 occurrences; (iv) "Doom (of Valyria), with 2 occurrences; (v) "Kings in the North", with 2 occurrences; (vi) "Narrow Sea", with 6 occurrences; (vii) "Stables", with 2 occurrences; and (viii) "Jest(s)", with 3 occurrences. They are discussed in detail below.

## **#01** Winter is/was coming

The first case of Consistency regards a House motto. Every great house in *A Game of Thrones* has its own motto, which usually says something about their values and character. "Winter is coming" is the motto of the House Stark, and sometimes it is used with its literal meaning since they live in the coldest city and also because winter lasts several years in the story. That being considered, they also use it as a metaphor for the idea that one should always be prepared for the worse. As a consequence, members of the Stark family often say this motto, changing the tense of it in order to fit the context – being literal or metaphorical.

The first appearance of the motto is on the book cover. In the PT-BR translation it says, "O inverno está chegando..." (simple present tense), which is a idiomatic combination. As a motto, it should be always translated by using the same lexical choice or one close enough. However, throughout the first eleven chapters every time this sentence appears – 3 occurrences encompassing lines #271, #272 and #700, as shown in Table 4 – it is translated as "O inverno está para chegar", which not only differ from the first translation presented to the reader, but also is closer to a PT-PT idiomatic combination, thus not sounding as natural as it should to the Brazilian reader.

Furthermore, considering that a House motto should be translated using the same lexical choice of the previous occurrences or the closest one to it, in line #502 – an excerpt of Ned Stark's thoughts –, "winter was coming" was an exception and was translated as "O inverno estava a caminho", thus using a different lexical choice from the other occurrences, which stick to "está chegando" instead of "está a caminho".

Table 9: Case of Consistency - "Winter is/was coming"

| Line # | North American English   | Brazilian Portuguese   |
|--------|--|--|
| 271    | And winter is coming.  | E o inverno está para<br>chegar.   |
| 272    | Winter is coming, said the Stark words.  | O inverno está para chegar,<br>diziam as palavras Stark.   |
| 502    | They were all listening, he knew. And winter was coming.   | Sabia que todos eles<br>escutavam. E o inverno<br>estava a caminho.  |
| 700    | "Maester Luwin, I trust you as I would my own blood. Give my wife your voice in all things great and small. Teach my son the things he needs to know. Winter is coming." | - Meistre Luwin, confio em vós como no meu próprio sangue. Dê à minha esposa a sua voz em todas as coisas grandes e pequenas. Ensine a meu filho aquilo que ele precisa saber. O inverno está para chegar. |

#### #02 Feet/Foot/Inches

Another occurrence of Consistency regards units of measurement. The US uses different units of measurement, e.g. feet and inches, from that used in Brazil, the metric system. In the eleven chapters analysed for this study, the 6 occurrences including feet and inches (lines #40, #86, #205, #409, #879 and #891) were successfully converted to the metric system, as shown in Table 5.

Table 10: Case of Consistency - Converted Units of Measurement

| Line # | North American English   | Brazilian Portuguese  |
|--------|--|---|
| 40     | Everyone talks about snows <b>forty <u>foot</u> deep</b> , and how the ice wind comes howling out of the north, but the real enemy is the cold.  | Toda a gente fala de neve com doze metros de profundidade, e do modo como o vento de gelo chega do norte uivando, mas o verdadeiro inimigo é o frio.  |
| 86     | The great sentinel was right there at the top of the ridge, where Will had known it would be, its lowest branches a bare <u>foot</u> off the ground.   | A grande árvore estava mesmo no topo da colina onde Will sabia que estaria, com os ramos inferiores <b>não</b> mais que trinta centímetros acima do solo.   |
| 205    | His father knelt and groped under the beast's head with his hand. He gave a yank and held it up for all to see. A <u>foot</u> of shattered antler, tines snapped off, all wet with blood.  | O pai ajoelhou-se e tateou sob a cabeça do animal. Deu um puxão e ergueu a coisa para que todos a vissem. <b>Trinta</b> centímetros de um chifre estilhaçado de veado, com as pontas partidas, todo vermelho de sangue.             |
| 409    | Six and a half <u>feet</u> tall, he towered over lesser men, and when he donned his armor and the great antlered helmet of his House, he became a veritable giant.   | Quase com dois metros de altura, erguia-se acima dos outros homens e, quando punha a armadura e o grande capacete provido de chifres de sua Casa, transformava-se num autêntico gigante.  |
| 879    | Bran knew about that. And he knew you could get inside the inner wall by the south gate, climb three floors and run all the way around Winterfell through a narrow tunnel in the stone, and then come out on ground level at the north gate, | Bran a conhecia. E também sabia que podia entrar na muralha interior pelo portão sul, subir três pisos e correr por todo Winterfell dentro de um túnel estreito aberto na pedra, e depois sair ao nível do chão no portão norte com |

|     | with a hundred <u>feet</u> of wall looming over you.   | trinta metros de muralha a<br>elevar-se acima da sua<br>cabeça.  |
|-----|--|--|
| 891 | The last part was the scramble up the blackened stones to the eyrie, <b>no more than ten <u>feet</u></b> , and then the crows would come round to see if you'd brought any corn. | A última parte era engatinhar pelas pedras enegrecidas até o ponto mais elevado, <b>não mais que três metros</b> , e então chegariam os corvos, para ver se tinha trazido milho. |

The exceptions to consistency in the conversions occurred in lines #131, 900, and 906, as listed in Table 6. In lines #131 and 900, "feet" was translated to its equivalent without conversion in PT-BR, "pés"; the same happening with line #906, with "inches" translated as "polegadas".

However, these are literal translations, and once we are dealing with a story adapted to the Brazilian context and culture, in line #131 the term "feet" should have been converted to the metric system (centimeters or meters); in line #900 and 906, "feet" and "inches", respectively, should be converted to centimeters.

Table 11: Case of Consistency - Non-Converted Units of Measurement

| Line # | North American English  | Brazilian Portuguese  |
|--------|---|---|
| 131    | He found what was left of the sword a <u>few</u> feet away, the end splintered and twisted like a tree struck by lightning. | Will encontrou o que restava da espada a alguns pés de distância, com a extremidade estilhaçada e retorcida, como uma árvore atingida por um relâmpago. |
| 900    | He wanted to hear more. <b>A few more</b> <u>feet</u> but they would see him if he swung out in front of the window.        | Bran compreendeu que falavam de seu pai. Quis ouvir mais. <b>Mais alguns</b> pés mas o veriam se balançasse na frente da janela.                        |

| 906 | Bran looked down. There was a narrow ledge beneath the window, <b>only a few inches</b> | Bran olhou para baixo. Havia<br>um estreito parapeito por<br>baixo da janela, <b>só com</b> |
|-----|---|---|
|     | wide.   | algumas <u>polegadas</u> de<br>largura.   |

#### #03 Protector of the Realm

The next case of Consistency regards the term "Protector of the Realm". "Protector of the Realm" is a title in *A Song of Ice and Fire*. Therefore, once this title is translated ca a lexical choice is made, the translator should make sure she will use the same words whenever this title appears, and so does the reviser in case the translator does not stick to her own choice.

However, as shown in Table 7, throughout the first eleven chapters of *A Game of Thrones* the title "Protector of the Realm" appeared twice, and was translated as "Protetor do Domínio" (line #144) and as "Protetor do Território" (line #376), thus not being consistent with the lexical choice made by the translator.

Table 12: Case of Consistency - "Protector of the Realm"

| Line # | North American English           | Brazilian Portuguese         |
|--------|----------------------------------|------------------------------|
|        | "In the name of Robert of the    | - Em nome de Robert da Casa  |
|        | House Baratheon, the First of    | Baratheon, o Primeiro do seu |
|        | his Name, King of the Andals     | Nome, rei dos Ândalos e dos  |
|        | and the Rhoynar and the First    | Roinares e dos Primeiros     |
|        | Men, Lord of the Seven           | Homens, Senhor dos Sete      |
| 144    | Kingdoms and <b>Protector of</b> | Reinos e <b>Protetor do</b>  |
|        | the Realm, by the word of        | Domínio, pela voz de Eddard  |
|        | Eddard of the House Stark,       | da Casa Stark, Senhor de     |
|        | Lord of Winterfell and           | Winterfell e Guardião do     |
|        | Warden of the North, I do        | Norte, condeno-o à morte     |
|        | sentence you to die."            |                              |
|        | "Viserys of the House            | - Viserys da Casa Targaryen, |
| 376    | Targaryen, the Third of his      | o Terceiro de seu Nome -     |
|        | Name," he called in a high,      | gritou numa voz doce e aguda |
|        | sweet voice, "King of the        | -, Rei dos Ândalos, dos      |

| Andals and the Rhoynar and          |
|-------------------------------------|
| the First Men, Lord of the          |
| Seven Kingdoms and                  |
| <b>Protector of the Realm</b> . His |
| sister, Daenerys Stormborn,         |
| Princess of Dragonstone. His        |
| honorable host, Illyrio             |
| Mopatis, Magister of the Free       |
| City of Pentos."                    |

Roinares e dos Primeiros Homens, Rei dos Sete Reinos e **Protetor do Território**. Sua irmã, Daenerys, Filha da Tormenta, Princesa de Pedra do Dragão. Seu honorável anfitrião, Illyrio Mopatis, Magíster da Cidade Livre de Pentos.

## **#04** Doom (of Valyria)

Another case of Consistency is related to the term "Doom (of Valyria)". This is also a title, regarding a very important history fact in *A Song of Ice and Fire*. Therefore, it is the same case as "Protector of the Realm": once the lexical choice was made, the translator should stick to it until the end and the reviser must make sure of it.

The first time this title appears, in line #274, it is incomplete, referring to it as "Doom" only, with capital letter, once Valyria had been previously mentioned and, as a consequence, indicating to the reader that "Doom" refers to an important event. However, for the PT-BR book it was translated as "destruição", with lower-case letter, consequently removing this indication and importance. The other occurrence (line #375), on the other hand, "Doom of Valyria" was translated correctly as "Destruição de Valíria", also respecting the capital letter configuration.

Table 13: Case of Consistency - "Doom (of Valyria)"

| Line # | North American English  | Brazilian Portuguese   |
|--------|---|--|
| 274    | It had been forged in <u>Valyria</u> , before the <b>Doom</b> had come to the old Freehold ()                   | Tinha sido forjada em <u>Valíria</u> antes de a <b>destruição</b> ter caído sobre a antiga cidade franca ()  |
| 375    | They were escorted across the entry hall, where a mosaic of colored glass depicted the <b>Doom of Valyria</b> . | Foram levados através do átrio, onde um mosaico de vidro colorido retratava a <b>Destruição de Valíria</b> . |

## **#05** Kings in the North

The fifth case of Consistency regards the title "Kings in the North". This case is similar to the previous one, "Doom (of Valyria)". The first appearance of "Kings in the North" was translated as "reis no Norte" (line #274), where "reis" was written with lower-case, thus removing the configuration of a title. The second occurrence of Consistency, line #432, was translated correctly as "Reis do Norte".

Furthermore, besides the lack of Consistency pointed out before, the two occurrences also differ in another point: line #274 translated the title as "no Norte" (in the North) whereas line #432 as "do Norte" (of the North).

Line # North American English Brazilian Portuguese

(...) when the Starks were Kings in the North. (...) quando os Stark eram reis no Norte.

(...) they had sworn allegiance (...) não tinham jurado

fidelidade a ninguém, fazendo

tratar-se por **Reis do Norte**.

Table 14: Case of Consistency - "Kings in the North"

#### #06 Narrow Sea

to no man, styling themselves the **Kings in the North**.

432

The sixth case of Consistency regards the term "narrow sea", encompassing lines #331, 332, 334, 360, 363, 783. "Narrow Sea" is the name of one of the seas in *A Song of Ice and Fire*, although until the point where analysis has been carried out, i.e. the first eleven chapters, "narrow sea" is each and every time presented in a lower-case letter.

Despite "narrow sea" being not presented until this point as a name, there has been an inconsistency in the translation by showing two different names for it:

 "estreito mar", which sounds natural in European Portuguese and is a unidiomatic combination in PT-BR, with 2 occurrences

 the first ones of them all – in lines #331 and #332; and.

 • "mar estreito", which is the best choice for Brazilian Portuguese, with 4 occurrences, in lines #334, #360, #363 and #783.

It is interesting to point out that once "mar estreito" was used in the translation — or the term started to be substituted by this one —, there was no more occurrences of "estreito mar", as showed in Table 10.

Table 15: Case of Consistency - "Narrow Sea"

| Line # | North American English  | Brazilian Portuguese  |
|--------|---|---|
| 331    | Somewhere beyond the sunset, across the <b>narrow sea</b> , lay a land of green hills and flowered plains and great rushing rivers ()   | Em algum lugar para lá do pôr do sol, do outro lado do estreito mar, havia uma terra de colinas verdes e planícies cobertas de flores e grandes rios caudalosos ()            |
| 332    | She had never seen this land<br>her brother said was theirs,<br>this realm beyond the <b>narrow</b><br><b>sea</b> .   | Nunca vira aquela terra que o irmão dizia que lhes pertencia, este domínio para lá do <b>estreito mar</b> .   |
| 334    | The Targaryen fleet was smashed while it lay at anchor, and huge stone blocks were ripped from the parapets and sent hurtling into the wild waters of the <b>narrow sea</b> . | A frota Targaryen fora esmagada enquanto estava ancorada e enormes blocos de pedra foram arrancados dos parapeitos e precipitados sobre as águas encapeladas do mar estreito. |
| 360    | Her brother, sprawled out on<br>his pillows beside her, never<br>noticed. His mind was away<br>across the <b>narrow sea</b> .   | O irmão, esparramado em<br>almofadas a seu lado, nada<br>notava. Sua mente estava<br>longe, do outro lado do <b>mar</b><br><b>estreito</b> .                                  |
| 363    | Dany had no agents, no way<br>of knowing what anyone was<br>doing or thinking across the<br>narrow sea, but she<br>mistrusted Illyrio's sweet<br>words as she mistrusted      | Dany não tinha agentes,<br>nenhuma maneira de saber o<br>que alguém estaria fazendo<br>ou pensando do outro lado do<br>mar estreito, mas<br>desconfiava das palavras          |

|     | everything about Illyrio.   | doces de Illyrio do mesmo<br>modo que desconfiava de<br>tudo o que dizia respeito a<br>ele.                        |
|-----|---|--|
| 783 | Arya had named her after the warrior queen of the Rhoyne, who had led her people across the <b>narrow sea</b> . | Arya dera-lhe o nome da rainha guerreira dos roinares, que levara seu povo para atravessar o <b>mar estreito</b> . |

#### #07 Stables

The seventh case of Consistency includes two occurrences of the word "stables", encompassing lines #1080 and #1098, which are part of the same chapter, from Jon Snow's point of view.

In the first occurrence Jon Snow is preparing to leave Winterfell and move to the Wall. So this excerpt presents a brief description of some of the movement regarding the preparations for the travel, including "(...) horses were being harnessed and saddled and led from the stables". The word "stables" was translated to PT-BR as "cavalariça", already commented in Idiom #30, which is acceptable a translation once it is comprehensible, although not a common word in PT-BR.

As to the second occurrence, line #1098, it occurs when Jon Snow says farewell to his stepbrother Robb Stark. Robb warns Jon that his uncle is waiting for him at the stables. This time, "Stables" was translated as "estábulos", which is the most known translation in PR-BR.

However, at the same time the translation for "stables" changed from one less known word – that is, perhaps, most common in PT-PT – to a more common one, this changing resulted in lack of Consistency. Moreover, such lack of Consistency became more evident to the reader once both occurrences are very near to each other in the text.

Table 16: Case of Consistency - "Stables"

| Line # | North American English   | Brazilian Portuguese  |
|--------|--|---|
| 1080   | Wagons were being loaded,<br>men were shouting, horses<br>were being harnessed and<br>saddled and led from the<br>stables. | Carregavam-se carroças,<br>homens gritavam, eram<br>postas armaduras e selas em<br>cavalos que eram tirados da<br>cavalariça. |
| 1098   | "Uncle Benjen said to send<br>you to the <b>stables</b> if I saw<br>you,"  | Tio Benjen disse para mandá-<br>lo para os <b>estábulos</b> se o<br>visse   |

**#08 Jest(s)** 

The eighth and last case of Consistency includes three occurrences of the word "jest(s)", lines #535, #1172 and #1175, respectively, as shown in Table 12.

Table 17: Case of Consistency - "Jest(s)"

| Line # | North American English  | Brazilian Portuguese  |
|--------|---|---|
| 535    | He made many a toast, laughed loudly at every <b>jest</b> , and attacked each dish like a starving man, but beside him the queen seemed as cold as an ice sculpture.  | Fizera muitos brindes, rira sonoramente com todas as <b>brincadeiras</b> e atacara todos os pratos como um faminto, mas, ao seu lado, a rainha parecia tão fria como uma escultura de gelo.                       |
| 1172   | They gorged themselves on horseflesh roasted with honey and peppers, drank themselves blind on fermented mare's milk and Illyrio's fine wines, and spat <b>jests</b> at each other across the fires, their voices harsh and | Empanturravam-se de carne de cavalo assada com mel e pimentões, bebiam leite fermentado de égua e os vinhos delicados de Illyrio até cair e cuspiam ditos de espírito uns aos outros, por cima das fogueiras, com |

|      | alien in Dany's ears.  | vozes ásperas e estranhas aos ouvidos de Dany.   |
|------|--|--|
| 1175 | Khal Drogo shouted commands and <b>jests</b> down to his bloodriders, and laughed at their replies, but he scarcely glanced at Dan beside him. | Khal Drogo gritava ordens e <b>brincadeiras</b> aos companheiros de sangue, e ria de suas respostas, mas quase não olhava para o seu lado. |

The first occurrence, line #535, is part of Jon Snow's chapter, in which he is at a feast observing his father's and the king's behavior while seated at the opposite end of the hall. Jon notices that "[the king] (...) made many a toast, laughed loudly at every jest, (...)". "Jest" was translated to PT-BR as "brincadeiras", which is the most known translation.

Both occurrences in lines #1172 and #1175 are from the same chapter, from Daenerys Targaryen's point of view. If line #535 was translated correctly and sound natural to the Brazilian reader, unfortunately the same cannot be said about the second occurrence, line #1172. "Jests" was translated as "ditos de espírito", and as mentioned before, this was also an occurrence of Smoothness, once this term is comprehensible to the reader, but does not feel natural in PT-BR.

The third and last occurrence of Consistency is line #1175. In this occurrence, Daenerys notices that her husband, Khal Drogo, shouted commands and jests to his people. This time "jests" was also translated as "brincadeiras", thus making the translating to come back to a smooth reading.

Moreover, were not for the second occurrence there would not be a lack of Consistency regarding the term "jest(s)". Also, the same way it occurred to case #08 of Consistency – "Stables" –, this lack of Consistency toward the translation of "jest(s)" became more evident because the last two occurrences are very near to each other in the same chapter.

It is important to emphasize that were it not for the particularities of this study – dealing with the adaptation (PT-BR) of the translation (PT-PT) from the original book in EN-US and the brief constructed for specifically for this piece of research –, it would not be

possible to find occurrences of translation that might not be considered translation errors otherwise.

Finally, it is important to point out that, with advances in technology, consistency has become a minor issue for translators or revisers, for they can now rely on Translation Memory Systems (TMS). As defined in *A Dictionary of Translation Technology* (Sin-wai Chan, 2004), Translation Memory System is a translation software.

In essence it is a database that stores translated sentences (translation units or segments) with their respective source segments in a database (the "memory"). For each new segment to be translated, the programme scans the database for a previous source segment that matches the new segment exactly or approximately (a fuzzy match) and, if found, suggests the corresponding target segment as a possible translation. The translator can then accept, modify or reject the suggested translation (p. 251).

TMS has as one of its great advantages the terminological standardization within a text. As a consequence, consistency might become obsolete or; at least, highly reduced. However, for such change to happen, it would be necessary an increase in the number of translators and revisers working with TMS.

## 4.4. Research Questions Revisited

The three main objectives of the present study were translated into three Research Questions (RQs) with a descriptive perspective, which I would like to revisit and answer. These RQs dealt with Mossop's model of translation revision and comparison between source text and translated text through the use of a parallel corpus available at www.copatrad.ufsc.br.

## 4.4.1. Research Question #1

How can Mossop's model account for occurrences of translation errors in the source text (ST) - target text (TT) comparison?

As analytical tool for translation errors in literary texts, Mossop's model for translation revision cannot account for the all of the translation error occurrences found in the ST-TT comparison, for although some of its parameters were not used, some occurrences of translation errors did not fit in any of the parameters presented by the author.

As to the parameters that were not used, they were Facts from group B, responsible for the content; Tailoring from group C, responsible for language; Sub-language also from group C; Layout from group D, responsible for presentation; Typography and Organization both from group D.

No occurrences of translation errors classified as Fact were found since this parameter deals with conceptual, factual or mathematical errors, which are related to the contexts of real life, and not fiction. In the case of *A Song of Ice and Fire*, the story is part of an epic fantasy world, thus with fictional characters and story. Therefore the parameter Fact cannot be applied to the translation errors of the book *A Game of Thrones*.

As to Tailoring, it is related to the different uses of the ST and TT – which differs according to the genre of the text –, thus regarding features such as the suitability of the text for its audience, degree of technicality, formality and tone, and also choice of vocabulary. These features are not applicable when it comes to the translation of literary texts in which the translator has a brief to recreate the ST author's style in the target language.

Sub-language is also concerned with the syntactic, lexical and rhetorical features of the text, such as field-specific terminology and typical phraseology, and therefore, it is not applicable for literary translation.

Furthermore, this study did not deal with any of the parameters presented in Group D related specifically to the presentation of the text – which includes the Layout, Typography and Organization parameters – because this piece of research work was concerned with the creation of an analytical tool to look at translation errors, it used only plain text to work with the comparison between ST and TT. These parameters are not relevant because they focus only on the paralinguistic level and the focus here is on linguistic.

#### 4.4.2. Research Ouestion #2

Are the parameters proposed in the model sufficient to classify all occurrences of errors in the PT-BR translation? Is it necessary to expand the model? What other parameters could be included?

This piece of research was able to identify 129 occurrences of translation error throughout the first eleven chapters of the book *A Game of Thrones*. From these 129 occurrences, only 98 could be classified according to the parameters proposed in Mossop's model, thus leaving 31 occurrences with no classification once the parameters proposed in the model were not sufficient to classify all occurrences of translation error.

As explained in subsection 4.3.7, Mossop dedicated a whole chapter on Consistency in his book, but did not include it in the translation revision model, thus not proposing it as a parameter.

Consequently, I propose the expansion of the model by adding a new parameter called "Consistency", which was able to classify alone the 31 occurrence found in this study that had not fit in any of the previous parameters.

### 4.4.3. Research Ouestion #3

To what extent Mossop's model can really be effective for translation revisers to carry out their task?

Translation revisers often have to strive to offer a good quality work under time constraints. However, a good quality service may take time, and in order to offer a service in a considerable short amount of time without lacking quality the reviser must be able to choose what to focus on his task, since working on all of the details is not always possible.

Mossop's translation revision model is an effective tool when it comes to deciding what the priorities are and what kind of translation errors one should look up to when carrying out their task. Additionally, offering a whole chapter on each of the parameters, explaining what each one of them is about and also offering a guide on how to proceed according to what is priority on the task, Mossop also classified the parameters into groups, which can be easy identified and chose according to the genre of the text the reviser is working with.

However, when it comes to specific cases such as the one presented in this study – a book released in another country that has been adapted from a similar language translation –, some details may go unnoticed if one is being guided only by Mossop's model. As explored in this study, the expansion of the model as to include the new parameter Consistency proves that the inconsistency resulted from the similarity of the two languages and the lack of a perhaps denser revision can cause several translation errors – with varying degree of influence in the comprehension/readability – in the TT and also that the model proposed by Mossop might not always be sufficient to account for all of the translation errors a reviser might come across.

## Chapter 5 Final Considerations

#### 5.1. Final Remarks

This final chapter is organized as follows. First, a summary of the main purposes discussed in the study are presented followed by its objectives, the method chosen for data analysis and a brief discussion of the results. Second, the limitations of the study are pointed out. Finally, some suggestions for further research are presented.

## **5.2. Summary of the Study**

The purpose of this study was to put to test Brian Mossop's translation revision model and transform it into analytical categories as a tool to look at translation errors in the translation from North American English to Brazilian Portuguese of the first book of the *A Song of Ice and Fire* book series, *A Game of Thrones*.

Chapter 1 dealt with the context of investigation of the study, which, being inserted in the TAT and GT research areas, it explained that this study was concerned with the translation of *A Game of Thrones* to the Brazilian context, after the Brazilian publishing house Leya decided to make an adaptation from the European Portuguese translation instead of working with its own translation. As a consequence, several Brazilian readers felt uneasiness towards the PT-BR translation, which I, as a reader, also felt. After that, the objectives and research questions for this study were presented.

Chapter 2 discussed the theoretical framework informing this study, which was composed by translation revision, types of revision, the concept of translation error, Brian Mossop's translation revision model and the concept of the brief.

Chapter 3 presented the method adopted to carry out this piece of research, describing the analytical procedures on how corpora were collected and also the treatment received before the analysis could be carried out.

Chapter 4 discussed and constructed a brief specific for this study taking into account the interview I made with Jorge Candeias, the Portuguese translator of *A Song of Ice and Fire*. After that, the results of the analysis were presented and discussed. Right after that, the research questions were revisited.

Finally, this chapter presents a summary of the study, the implications of the research and also discusses the limitations and suggestions for further research.

## **5.3. Implications of the Study**

It was very interesting to carry out this piece of research. First of all, because following Brian Mossop's procedures on how to analyze a translation provided me with the opportunity to see how translation errors can be found out (or missed) if you decide on make a unilingual or a bilingual reading.

Second, sometimes it was very hard to decide in which category a translation error should be classified once some of the parameters of Mossop's model merge together somehow. However, such confusion did not last long for all I had to do was to follow the brief constructed specifically for this study. As a consequence, it was interesting to notice how a translation error may be classified differently according to what one expects from the translation or that a translation error may not be considered an error at all.

Third, as both reader and researcher I found it interesting to look into the translation errors and understand the underlying processes that gave me, my friends and the readers over the Internet the feeling of uneasiness and my impression that something was wrong when reading the first book, *A Game of Thrones*.

Finally, by carrying out this piece of research I was able to transform Brian Mossop's translation revision model into an analytical tool to look at translation errors and also show that this model did not contain all the parameters necessary to look at translation errors.

# 5.4. Limitations of the Study and Suggestions for Further Research

This study presents some limitations due to issues that were not fully explored or that were left untouched. Considering these limitations, I discuss some of them briefly below.

Firstly, from the 73 chapters of the book *A Game of Thrones*, only 11 chapters were explored. Reading the same chapter several times focusing on specific aspects of the texts each time is an activity that takes time, especially if this activity includes one making a comparison between source text and translated text sentence by sentence. As a

consequence, only the first eleven chapters were explored, although I intended to explored the whole book. Also, considering that from the 12 parameters presented by Brian Mossop 6 were found and also 1 category had to be created, I would like to point out that – not only as a researcher, but also as a avid reader of the *A Song of Ice and Fire* book series – I remember finding other occurrences of translation errors throughout the reading of the first book that fit categories that I was not able to find in the first 11 chapters, such as spelling issues (which are occurrences of Mechanics), and also translation errors of a more serious nature that influence directly on the comprehension of the story, such as changing one character's name by another (e.g. Gregor Clegane replaced with Sandor Clegane), as did happen in book 3 (Martin, 2003, p. 671), called *A Tormenta de Espadas* (*A Storm of Swords*, p. 897).

Second, the issue of Consistency that has become a minor issue for translators or revisers in case they use Translation Memory Systems. As explained before, working with any characteristic connected to TMS was not the focus of this study and, as a consequence, I did not explore the implications of the use or misuse of a TMS.

Some of the limitations of the study being considered, I would like to make some suggestions for further research.

Firstly, in order to borrow the parameters from Brian Mossop's translation revision model and fully explore them as categories for translation error analysis tool, it would be interesting to continue this study by carrying out the analysis not only though the other 62 chapters of the *A Game of Thrones* I did not explore, but the other books of the *A Song of Ice and Fire* as well.

Second, it would also be interesting to explore what would happen to the issue of Consistency by using Translation Memory Systems right in the translation draft. Or, perhaps someone in Brazil interested in the topic of this study could also retranslate to Brazilian Portuguese some of the first book chapters by using the TSM and then compare it to the translation of the Brazilian publishing house Leya.

Finally, I would like to point out that this study tried to contribute to the field of TS by proposing the use of Brian Mossop's translation revision model as a tool for the analysis of translation error, and by doing so, also create a more effective tool for translation revisers to carry out their tasks.

#### References

- Baker, M. (1998). *Routledge Encyclopaedia of Translation Studies*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Chan, S. (2004). *A dictionary of translation technology*. Hong Kong: Chinese University Press.
- Ganser, D. (2011, November 30). *Editing and/or Revising Translations*. Retrieved April 17, 2012, from http://www.transimpex.com/454/editing-andor-revising-translations/
- Hablamos Juntos. (2009). *Developing the Translation Brief: Why & How.* Retrieved November 23, 2013, from Hablamos Juntos: http://www.hablamosjuntos.org/mtw/html\_toolkit/tool\_3/t3\_pag e 1.html
- Holmes, J. (1972, 1988, 2000). The Name and Nature of Translation Studies. In: *Translated! Papers on Literary Translation and Translation Studies*. Amsterdam: Rodopi.
- Künzli, A. (2007). The Ethical Dimension of Translation Revision. An Empirical Study. *The Journal of Specialised Translation*, Issue 8.
- Martin, G. (2003). A Storm of Swords. New York: Bantam.
- \_\_\_\_\_(2010). *A Guerra dos Tronos*. Trad. Jorge Candeias. São Paulo: Leya.
- \_\_\_\_(2011). A Game of Thrones. New York: Bantam.
  - \_\_\_\_(2011). A Tormenta de Espadas. São Paulo: Leya.
- Mossop, B. (2001). *Editing and Revising for Translators*. Manchester, UK: St. Jerome Publishing.
- Nord, C. (1997). Defining Translation Functions. The translation brief as a guideline for the trainee translator. In: W. Lorscher, ed. *Ilha do Desterro*, n°. 33, pp. 39-53.
- Olohan, M. (2004). *Introducing Corpora in Translation Studies*. London: Routledge.
- Palumbo, G. (2009). *Key Terms in Translation Studies*. London: Continuum International Publishing Group.
- Robert, I. (2008). Translation Revision Procedures: An Explorative Study. In: *Translation and Its Others. Selected Papers of the CETRA Research Seminar in Translation Studies* 2007. Retrieved April 17, 2012, from http://www.kuleuven.be/cetra/papers/papers.htlm

- Somers, N. (2001, January). *Revision Food for Thought*. Retrieved April 17, 2012, from Translation Journal: http://translationjournal.net/journal/15revision.htm
- Williams, J., Chesterman, A. (2002). *The Map: A Beginner's Guide to Doing Research in Translation Studies*. Manchester and Northampton: St. Jerome Publishing.

## Appendix

**Appendix 1: Full Table of Occurrences of Translation Errors** 

| Line #       | North American<br>English  | Brazilian<br>Portuguese   | Parameter    |
|--------------|--|---|--------------|
| 0<br>(Cover) | Winter is coming   | O inverno está chegando   | Consistency  |
| 14           | Gared had spent<br>forty years in the<br>Night's Watch, man<br>and boy, and he was<br>not accustomed to<br>being made light of.                              | Ele passara quarenta<br>anos na Patrulha da<br>Noite, <b>em homem e</b><br><b>em rapaz</b> , e não<br>estava acostumado a<br>ser desvalorizado.   | Idiom        |
| 15           | The first time he had been sent beyond, all the old stories had come rushing back, and his bowels had turned to water.  He had laughed about it afterward.   | Da primeira vez que<br>fora enviado para lá,<br>todas as velhas<br>histórias lhe tinham<br>acorrido ao cérebro,<br>e suas entranhas se<br>tinham feito em<br>água.  | Completeness |
| 20           | "Bet he killed them<br>all himself, <b>he did</b> ,"<br>Gared told the<br>barracks over wine,<br>"twisted their little<br>heads off, our<br>mighty warrior." | "Aposto que foi ele<br>próprio quem as<br>matou todas, <b>ah</b> ,<br><b>pois aposto</b> ",<br>dissera Gared na<br>caserna, entre os<br>vapores do vinho,<br>"torceu-lhes as<br>cabecinhas e<br>arrancou-as, o nosso<br>poderoso guerreiro" | Idiom        |
| 30           | Some swords, <b>a few bows</b> .   | Algumas espadas,<br>uns quantos arcos.  | Idiom        |
| 30           | Heavy-looking,<br>double-bladed, a<br>cruel piece of iron.   | Com ar de ser<br>pesado, duas<br>lâminas, <b>um cruel</b>   | Idiom        |

|     |  | bocado de ferro.   |            |
|-----|--|--|------------|
| 36  | "You have a chill?"<br>Royce asked.  | - Está enregelado?<br>- perguntou Royce.   | Idiom      |
| 65  | "There's something<br>wrong here," Gared<br>muttered.  | - Há qualquer coisa<br>de errado aqui -<br>murmurou Gared.   | Idiom      |
| 67  | "Is there?"  | - Aí há?   | Smoothness |
| 68  | "Can't you feel it?"<br>Gared asked.   | - <b>Não o sentiu</b> ? - perguntou Gared.   | Idiom      |
| 90  | "Something's<br>wrong."  | - Há algo de<br>errado.  | Idiom      |
| 98  | He went to the tree, a vaulting <b>grey- green</b> sentinel, and began to climb.   | Dirigiu-se para a<br>árvore, uma<br>sentinela abobadada<br>cinzenta<br>esverdeada, e<br>começou a subir.   | Accuracy   |
| 107 | Its armor seemed to change color as it moved; here it was white as new-fallen snow, there black as shadow, everywhere dappled with the deep grey-green of the trees. | Sua armadura parecia mudar de cor quando se movia; aqui era tão branca como neve recém- caída, ali, negra como uma sombra, por todo o lado sarapintada com o profundo cinzento esverdeado das árvores. | Accuracy   |
| 109 | His <u>voice</u> <b>cracked</b> like a boy's.  | A <u>voz</u> estava<br><b>quebrada</b> como a<br>de um rapaz.  | Idiom      |
| 110 | There was a faint<br>blue shimmer to the<br>thing, a ghost-light   | Havia naquela coisa<br>uma tênue cintilação<br>azul, uma luz   | Smoothness |

|     | that played around its <b>edges</b> , and somehow Will knew it was sharper than any razor.   | fantasmagórica que<br>brincava com os<br>seus <b>limites</b> , e de<br>algum modo Will<br>soube que era mais<br>afiada do que<br>qualquer navalha.  |             |
|-----|--|---|-------------|
| 114 | The Other halted. Will saw its eyes; blue, deeper and bluer than any human eyes, a blue that burned like ice. They fixed on the longsword trembling on high, watched the moonlight running cold along the metal. For a heartbeat he dared to hope. | O Outro parou. Will viu seus olhos, azuis, mais profundos e mais azuis do que quaisquer olhos humanos, de um azul que queimava como gelo. Will fixou-se na espada que estremecia, erguida, e observou o luar que corria, frio, ao longo do metal. Durante um segundo, atreveu-se a ter esperança. | Logic       |
| 120 | Blood welled between the rings. It steamed in the cold, and the droplets seemed red as fire where they touched the snow.   | Surgiu sangue por<br>entre os aros, <b>correu</b><br><b>ao frio</b> , e as gotas<br>pareciam vermelhas<br>como fogo onde<br>tocavam a neve.   | Accuracy    |
| 126 | The watchers moved forward together, as if some signal had been given.   | Os observadores aproximaram-se uns dos outros, como que em resposta a um sinal.   | Accuracy    |
| 131 | He found what was left of the sword <b>a few feet away</b> , the   | Will encontrou o<br>que restava da<br>espada <b>a alguns pés</b>  | Consistency |

|     | 1 11 . 1 1                                   | 1 11 (0 1                |              |
|-----|--|--------------------------|--------------|
|     | end splintered and                           | de distância, com a      |              |
|     | twisted like a tree                          | extremidade              |              |
|     | struck by lightning.                         | estilhaçada e            |              |
|     |  | retorcida, como uma      |              |
|     |  | árvore atingida por      |              |
|     |  | um relâmpago.            |              |
|     | () Lord of the                               | () Senhor dos Sete       |              |
| 144 | Seven Kingdoms                               | Reinos e <b>Protetor</b> | Consistance  |
| 144 | and Protector of the                         | do Domínio ()            | Consistency  |
|     | Realm ()                                     |                          |              |
|     | It seemed colder on                          | O tempo parecia          |              |
|     | the long ride back to                        | mais frio durante a      |              |
|     | Winterfell, though                           | longa viagem de          |              |
| 150 | the wind had died                            | regresso a               | <b>A</b>     |
| 152 | by then and the sun                          | Winterfell, embora o     | Accuracy     |
|     | was higher in the                            | vento tivesse caído      |              |
|     | sky.   | e o sol estivesse        |              |
|     | ~ <b>J</b> ·                                 | mais alto no céu.        |              |
|     | He was big and                               | Era grande e largo e     |              |
|     | broad and growing                            | crescia dia a dia,       |              |
|     | every day, with his                          | com as cores da          |              |
|     | mother's coloring,                           | mãe, a pele clara, os    |              |
| 153 | the fair skin, <b>red</b> -                  | cabelos vermelho-        | Accuracy     |
|     | brown hair, and                              | acastanhados e os        |              |
|     | blue eyes of the                             | olhos azuis dos          |              |
|     | Tullys of Riverrun.                          | Tully de Correrrio.      |              |
|     | In truth, the man                            | Na verdade, o            |              |
|     | was an oath                                  | homem era <b>um</b>      |              |
| 169 | <b>breaker</b> , a deserter                  | insurreto, um            | Idiom        |
| 109 | from the Night's                             | desertor da Patrulha     | Idioiii      |
|     | Watch.                                       | da Noite.                |              |
|     | "Come, let us see                            | - Vamos, vamos ver       |              |
|     | *  |                          |              |
| 177 | what <b>mischief</b> my sons have rooted out | que <b>velhacaria</b>    | Idiom        |
|     |  | desenterraram agora      |              |
|     | now."  | os meus filhos           |              |
|     | It nuzzled blindly                           | Batia cegamente          |              |
| 196 | against Robb's chest                         | com o focinho            | Completeness |
|     | as he cradled it,                            | contra o peito de        | 1            |
|     | searching for milk                           | Robb, procurando         |              |

|     | among his leathers,<br>making a sad little<br>whimpery sound.   | leite nos couros que<br>o cobriam, soltando<br>um pequeno som<br>lamentoso e triste,<br>()   |              |
|-----|---|--|--------------|
| 197 | "Go on," Robb told<br>him. "You can touch<br>him."  | - <b>Vá lá</b> - disse-lhe<br>Robb, - Pode tocá-lo   | Idiom        |
| 204 | "There's <b>something</b> in the throat,"   | - Há <b>qualquer coisa</b><br>na garganta  | Idiom        |
| 237 | These are not dogs to beg for <b>treats</b> and slink off at a kick.  | Esses não são cães que peçam <b>festas</b> ou se esquivem a um pontapé.  | Idiom        |
| 256 | It was a dark, primal place, three acres of old forest untouched for ten thousand years as the gloomy castle rose around it.              | Era um lugar escuro e primordial, três acres de floresta antiga, intocada ao longo de dez mil anos, enquanto o castelo se levantava a toda sua volta.                          | Completeness |
| 256 | This was a wood of stubborn sentinel trees armored in <b>grey-green</b> needles, of mighty oaks, of ironwoods as old as the realm itself. | Aquele era um bosque de obstinadas árvores sentinelas, revestidas de agulhas cinzaesverdeadas, de poderosos carvalhos, de árvores de pauferro tão velhas como o próprio reino. | Accuracy     |
| 261 | In the south the last<br>weirwoods had been<br>cut down or burned<br>out a thousand years<br>ago, except on the                           | No sul, os últimos<br>represeiros tinham<br>sido derrubados ou<br>queimados havia mil<br>anos, exceto na Ilha  | Accuracy     |

|     | Isle of Faces where the green men kept their silent watch. Up here it was different.   | das Caras, onde os<br>homens verdes<br>mantinham sua<br>vigilância silenciosa<br>e as coisas eram<br>diferentes.  |             |
|-----|--|---|-------------|
| 271 | And winter is coming.  | E o inverno está<br>para chegar.  | Consistency |
| 272 | Winter is coming, said the Stark words.  | O inverno está<br>para chegar, diziam<br>as palavras Stark.   | Consistency |
| 273 | "The man died well, I'll give him that," Ned said.   | - O homem morreu<br>bem, <b>posso lhe</b><br><b>assegurar</b> - disse<br>Ned.   | Accuracy    |
| 274 | It had been forged in Valyria, before the Doom had come to the old Freehold ()   | Tinha sido forjada<br>em <u>Valíria</u> antes de<br>a <b>destruição</b> ter<br>caído sobre a antiga<br>cidade franca ()   | Consistency |
| 274 | () when the Starks were <b>Kings in the North</b> .  | () quando os Stark eram <b>reis no Norte</b> .  | Consistency |
| 281 | "There are <b>darker</b><br><u>things</u> beyond the<br>Wall."   | - Há <u>coisas</u> <b>mais</b><br><b>escuras</b> para lá da<br>Muralha  | Smoothness  |
| 285 | You did not come here to tell me <b>crib</b> tales.  | Não veio até aqui<br>me contar <b>histórias</b><br><b>de embalar</b> .  | Idiom       |
| 330 | Dany could hear the singing of the red priests as they lit their night fires and the shouts of ragged children playing games beyond the walls of the estate. | Ela conseguia ouvir<br>os sacerdotes<br>vermelhos cantando,<br>enquanto acendiam<br>as piras noturnas, e<br>os gritos de <b>crianças</b><br><b>esfarrapadas que</b><br><b>jogavam</b> para lá dos<br>muros da | Smoothness  |

|     |  | propriedade.  |              |
|-----|--|---|--------------|
| 331 | () where towers of dark stone rose amidst magnificent <b>blue-grey</b> mountains, ()   | () onde torres de<br>pedra negra se<br>erguiam por entre<br>magníficas<br>montanhas azul-<br>acinzentadas ()  | Accuracy     |
| 331 | "Ours by blood<br>right, taken from us<br>by treachery, <b>but</b><br><b>ours still, ours</b><br><b>forever</b> . You do not<br>steal from the<br>dragon, oh, no. The<br>dragon remembers."  | - É nosso direito de<br>sangue, usurpado<br>por meios<br>traiçoeiros. Não se<br>rouba um dragão,<br>ah, não. O dragão se<br>lembra.   | Completeness |
| 334 | She had been born on Dragonstone <b>nine moons</b> after their flight, ()  | Nascera em Pedra<br>do Dragão <b>quatro</b><br><b>luas</b> depois da fuga,<br>()  | Accuracy     |
| 331 | Somewhere beyond the sunset, across the <b>narrow sea</b> , lay a land of green hills and flowered plains and great rushing rivers, where towers of dark stone rose amidst magnificent blue-grey mountains, and armored knights rode to battle beneath the banners of their lords. | Em algum lugar para lá do pôr do sol, do outro lado do estreito mar, havia uma terra de colinas verdes e planícies cobertas de flores e grandes rios caudalosos, onde torres de pedra negra se erguiam por entre magníficas montanhas azulacinzentadas e cavaleiros de armadura cavalgavam para a batalha sob os estandartes dos seus | Consistency  |

|     |   | senhores.   |             |
|-----|---|---|-------------|
| 332 | And perhaps the dragon did remember, but Dany could not. She had never seen this land her brother said was theirs, this realm beyond the <b>narrow sea</b> .          | E o dragão talvez recordasse mesmo, mas Dany não. Nunca vira aquela terra que o irmão dizia que lhes pertencia, este domínio para lá do estreito mar.                         | Consistency |
| 334 | The Targaryen fleet was smashed while it lay at anchor, and huge stone blocks were ripped from the parapets and sent hurtling into the wild waters of the narrow sea. | A frota Targaryen fora esmagada enquanto estava ancorada e enormes blocos de pedra foram arrancados dos parapeitos e precipitados sobre as águas encapeladas do mar estreito. | Consistency |
| 336 | He called her "Little Princess" and sometimes "My Lady" ()  | Chamava a "pequena princesa" e, por vezes, "minha senhora" ()   | Mechanics   |
| 343 | The old woman washed her long, silver-pale hair and gently combed out the snags, all in silence.  | A mulher mais velha lavou seus longos cabelos esbranquiçados e removeu suavemente os nós com uma escova, sempre em silêncio.  | Accuracy    |
| 344 | She had always assumed that she would wed Viserys when she came of age.   | Sempre assumira<br>que se casaria com<br>Viserys quando<br>chegasse à idade<br>adulta.  | Idiom       |

| 360 | Her brother,<br>sprawled out on his<br>pillows beside her,<br>never noticed. His<br>mind was away<br>across the narrow<br>sea.  | O irmão,<br>esparramado em<br>almofadas a seu<br>lado, nada notava.<br>Sua mente estava<br>longe, do outro lado<br>do mar estreito.  | Consistency |
|-----|---|--|-------------|
| 363 | Dany had no agents, no way of knowing what anyone was doing or thinking across the narrow sea, but she mistrusted Illyrio's sweet words as she mistrusted everything about Illyrio. | Dany não tinha agentes, nenhuma maneira de saber o que alguém estaria fazendo ou pensando do outro lado do mar estreito, mas desconfiava das palavras doces de Illyrio do mesmo modo que desconfiava de tudo o que dizia respeito a ele. | Consistency |
| 375 | They were escorted across the entry hall, where a mosaic of colored glass depicted the <b>Doom of Valyria</b> .   | Foram levados<br>através do átrio,<br>onde um mosaico de<br>vidro colorido<br>retratava a<br><b>Destruição de</b><br>Valíria.  | Consistency |
| 376 | () Lord of the<br>Seven Kingdoms<br>and <b>Protector of the</b><br><b>Realm</b> .   | () Rei dos Sete<br>Reinos e <b>Protetor</b><br><b>do Território</b> .  | Consistency |
| 377 | Yet among them moved <b>bravos</b> and sell swords from Pentos and Myr and Tyrosh, ()   | Mas por entre eles<br>moviam-se <b>sicários</b><br>e mercenários de<br>Pentos, Myr e<br>Tyrosh, ()   | Accuracy    |

| 382 | "What is he doing here?" she <b>blurted</b> .   | - Que faz ele aqui? - ela <b>perguntou</b> .  | Accuracy     |
|-----|---|---|--------------|
| 415 | "Take me down to<br>your crypt, Eddard. I<br>would <b>pay</b> <u>my</u><br><u>respects</u> ."   | - Leve-me à sua<br>cripta, Eddard.<br>Quero <b>apresentar</b><br>os meus respeitos.   | Idiom        |
| 432 | () they had sworn allegiance to no man, styling themselves the <b>Kings in the North</b> .  | () não tinham<br>jurado fidelidade a<br>ninguém, fazendo<br>tratar-se por <b>Reis do</b><br><b>Norte</b> .  | Consistency  |
| 441 | "She should be on a hill somewhere, under a <b>fruit tree</b> , with the sun and clouds above her and the rain to wash her clean."  | - Podia estar em algum lugar numa colina, sob uma árvore de fruto, com o sol e nuvens acima dela e a chuva para lavá-la.                                      | Idiom        |
| 453 | "I had not<br>forgotten," Ned<br>replied quietly.<br>When the king did<br>not answer, he said,<br>"Tell me about Jon."  | - Não me esqueci -<br>respondeu Ned<br>calmamente. Fale-<br>me de Jon.  | Completeness |
| 465 | Robert laughed, the sound rattling among the tombs and bouncing from the vaulted ceiling. His smile was a flash of white teeth in the thicket of the huge black beard. "Ah, Ned," he said, "you are still too serious." | Robert soltou uma<br>gargalhada, fazendo<br>o som chocalhar por<br>entre as sepulturas e<br>ressoar no teto<br>abobadado Ah,<br>Ned, continua sério<br>demais | Completeness |
| 469 | "For the joy of my company, surely," he said <b>lightly</b> .   | - Pela alegria da<br>minha companhia,<br>certamente - disse,  | Idiom        |

|     |   | com ligeireza.  |             |
|-----|---|---|-------------|
| 481 | They all want something, money or land or justice.  | Todos querem<br>qualquer coisa,<br>dinheiro, terra ou<br>justiça.   | Accuracy    |
| 488 | If I wanted to honor you, I'd let you retire.   | Se quisesse honrá-<br>lo, deixaria que se<br>aposentasse?   | Mechanics   |
| 492 | Ned was still on one knee, <u>his eyes</u> <b>upraised</b> .  | Ned continuava sobre o joelho, <u>sem</u> <b>alegria</b> <u>nos olhos</u> .   | Accuracy    |
| 502 | They were all listening, he knew. And winter was coming.  | Sabia que todos eles escutavam. E o inverno estava a caminho.   | Consistency |
| 506 | Its <b>grey</b> stone walls were draped with banners.   | As <b>grandes</b> <u>paredes</u> <u>de pedra</u> do salão estavam adornadas com estandartes.  | Accuracy    |
| 506 | () his voice could scarcely be heard above the roar of the fire, the clangor of <b>pewter</b> plates and cups, and the low mutter of a hundred drunken conversations. | () quase não se conseguia ouvir sua voz acima do rugir do fogo, do clangor de pratos e taças de <b>peltre</b> , e do burburinho grave de uma centena de conversas ébrias. | Idiom       |
| 507 | Jon's brothers and sisters had been seated with the royal children, beneath the raised platform where Lord and Lady Stark hosted the king and queen.                  | Os irmãos e irmãs de Jon tinham sido postos junto dos filhos do rei, <b>por baixo</b> da plataforma elevada onde o Senhor e a Senhora Stark recebiam o rei e a rainha.    | Accuracy    |

| 516 | After all had been seated, toasts were made, thanks were given and returned, and then the feasting began.  | Depois de todos se<br>terem sentado,<br>foram feitos brindes,<br>dados e devolvidos<br>agradecimentos e,<br>então, deu-se início<br>ao <b>festim</b> .   | Idiom    |
|-----|--|--|----------|
| 529 | His uncle was sharp-featured and gaunt as a mountain crag, but there was always a hint of laughter in his <b>blue-grey</b> eyes.   | O tio de Jon tinha<br>feições angulosas e<br>era descarnado<br>como um penhasco,<br>mas havia sempre<br>uma sugestão de riso<br>em seus <u>olhos</u> azul-<br>acinzentados.  | Accuracy |
| 547 | "Daeren Targaryen<br>was only <b>fourteen</b><br>when he conquered<br>Dorne," Jon said.  | - Daeren Targaryen<br>tinha só <b>quinze</b> anos<br>quando conquistou<br>Dome - disse Jon.  | Accuracy |
| 578 | The wolf pup padded closer and nuzzled at Jon's face, but he kept a wary eye on Tyrion Lannister, and when the dwarf reached out to pet him, he drew back and bared his fangs in a silent snarl. | A cria de lobo aproximou-se e encostou o focinho no rosto de Jon, mas manteve um olho cuidadoso em Tyrion Lannister, e, quando o anão estendeu a mão para lhe fazer uma festa, afastou-se e mostrou os caninos num rosnado silencioso. | Accuracy |
| 592 | Never forget what you are, for surely the world <b>will not</b> .  | Nunca se esqueça de quem é, porque é certo que o mundo não se lembrará.  | Accuracy |
| 602 | Catelyn's bath was<br>always hot and<br>steaming, and her  | O <b>banho</b> <u>de Catelyn</u><br>era sempre quente e<br>cheio de vapor, e   | Accuracy |

|     | walls warm to the touch.  | suas <u>paredes</u> ,<br>mornas ao toque.   |              |
|-----|---|---|--------------|
| 623 | Ned turned away from her, back to the night. <b>He stood</b> staring out in the darkness, watching the moon and the stars perhaps, or perhaps the sentries on the wall. | Ned virou-lhe as costas, devolvendo o olhar à noite. E ficou observando talvez a lua e as estrelas, talvez as sentinelas na muralha.                                  | Completeness |
| 625 | She was about to go to him when the knock came at the door, loud and unexpected. Ned turned, <b>frowning</b> .  | Preparava-se para se<br>aproximar dele<br>quando alguém<br>bateu à porta, sonora<br>e inesperadamente.<br>Ned virou-se,<br>franzindo o olho.                          | Idiom        |
| 658 | "I'm afraid," she admitted. She reached out and took the letter in <b>trembling</b> hands.  | - Tenho medo - ela<br>admitiu. Esticou o<br>braço e pegou na<br>carta com <u>mãos</u><br><b>trementes</b> .   | Idiom        |
| 693 | "The Others take <b>both of you</b> ," Ned muttered darkly.   | - Que os Outros<br>levem <u>os dois</u> -<br>murmurou Ned em<br>tom sombrio.  | Accuracy     |
| 698 | You must govern the north in my stead, while I run Robert's errands.  | Deve governar o<br>Norte em meu nome<br>enquanto trato dos<br>recados de Robert.  | Accuracy     |
| 700 | "Maester Luwin, I trust you as I would my own blood. Give my wife your voice in all things great and small. Teach my son the things he needs to know.                   | - Meistre Luwin,<br>confio em vós como<br>no meu próprio<br>sangue. Dê à minha<br>esposa a sua voz em<br>todas as coisas<br>grandes e pequenas.<br>Ensine a meu filho | Consistency  |

|     | Winter is coming."   | aquilo que ele<br>precisa saber. O<br>inverno está para<br>chegar.  |             |
|-----|--|---|-------------|
| 713 | "Thank you, my<br>lady," he whispered.<br>" <b>This is hard</b> , I<br>know."  | - Obrigado, senhora<br>minha - murmurou<br><b>Isto é duro</b> , bem<br>sei.   | Smoothness  |
| 738 | "A <b>hard</b> <u>sacrifice</u> ,"<br>Maester Luwin<br>agreed.   | - É um <u>sacrifício</u> <b>duro</b> - concordou Meistre Luwin.   | Smoothness  |
| 738 | Yet these are <b>hard</b> times, my lord.  | Mas estes são tempos duros, senhor.   | Smoothness  |
| 783 | Arya had named her after the warrior queen of the Rhoyne, who had led her people across the narrow sea.  | Arya dera-lhe o<br>nome da rainha<br>guerreira dos<br>roinares, que levara<br>seu povo para<br>atravessar o mar<br>estreito.  | Consistency |
| 784 | "Come," she whispered to Nymeria. She got up and ran, the wolf coming hard at her heels.   | "Anda", sussurrou a<br>Nymeria. Levantou-<br>se e correu, com a<br>loba a morder-lhe<br>os calcanhares.   | Accuracy    |
| 794 | They were <b>huffing</b> and puffing and hitting at each other with padded wooden swords under the watchful eye of old Ser Rodrik Cassel, the master-at-arms, () | Fanfarronavam,<br>ofegavam e<br>atacavam-se um ao<br>outro com espadas<br>almofadadas de<br>madeira, sob o olhar<br>vigilante de Sor<br>Rodrik Cassel, o<br>mestre de armas, () | Idiom       |
| 813 | "A wolf with a fish in its mouth?" It made her laugh.  | - Um lobo com um<br>peixe na boca? - a<br>idéia a fez rir   | Idiom       |

|     | "That would look silly.  | Pareceria disparatado.   |            |
|-----|--|--|------------|
| 816 | Prince Tommen was <b>rolling</b> in the dust, trying to get up and failing.  | Príncipe Tommen<br>rebolava na poeira,<br>tentando sem<br>sucesso pôr-se em<br>pé.   | Accuracy   |
| 862 | The king wanted wild boar at the <b>feast</b> tonight.   | O rei desejava javali<br>para o <b>festim</b> da<br>noite.   | Idiom      |
| 865 | The twins Ser Erryk and Ser Arryk, who had died on one another's swords hundreds of years ago, when brother fought sister in the war the <b>singers</b> called the Dance of the Dragons. | () os gêmeos, Sor<br>Erryk e Sor Arryk,<br>que tinham morrido<br>pelas espadas um do<br>outro havia centenas<br>de anos, quando<br>irmãos lutavam<br>contra irmãs na<br>guerra que os <b>poetas</b><br>chamavam a Dança<br>dos Dragões; () | Accuracy   |
| 866 | () and Ser Meryn had <b>droopy eyes</b> and a beard the color of rust.   | () e Sor Meryn<br>tinha <b>olhos</b><br><b>inclinados</b> e uma<br>barba cor de<br>ferrugem.   | Accuracy   |
| 868 | That was the end of his farewells.  Instead Bran spent the morning alone in the godswood, trying to teach his wolf to fetch a stick, and failing.  | Foi o fim das<br>despedidas. Em<br>lugar delas, passou<br>a manhã sozinho no<br>bosque sagrado,<br>tentando sem<br>sucesso ensinar o<br>lobo a buscar um<br>pedaço de pau.   | Idiom      |
| 898 | Stannis and Renly are one thing, and Eddard Stark is quite another. <b>Robert will</b>   | Stannis e Renly são<br>uma coisa, Eddard<br>Stark é outra<br>totalmente diferente.   | Smoothness |

|     | listen to Stark.   | Robert escutará<br>Stark.  |             |
|-----|--|--|-------------|
| 898 | I should have insisted that he name you, but I was certain Stark would refuse him.   | Eu devia ter insistido para que ele o nomeasse, mas tinha certeza de que Stark lhe diria não.                                    | Smoothness  |
| 900 | He wanted to hear<br>more. A few more<br><b>feet</b> but they<br>would see him if he<br>swung out in front<br>of the window.       | Bran compreendeu que falavam de seu pai. Quis ouvir mais. Mais alguns <b>pés</b> mas o veriam se balançasse na frente da janela. | Consistency |
| 901 | "We will have to watch him carefully," the woman said.   | - Teremos de <u>vigiá</u> -<br><b>los</b> cuidadosamente<br>- disse a mulher.  | Accuracy    |
| 906 | Bran looked down. There was a narrow ledge beneath the window, only a few inches wide.   | Bran olhou para<br>baixo. Havia um<br>estreito parapeito<br>por baixo da janela,<br>só com algumas<br>polegadas de<br>largura.   | Consistency |
| 910 | "When he had<br>already agreed to<br>foster that weakling<br>son of hers at<br>Casterly Rock? I<br>think not.                      | - Depois de já termos concordado em criar aquele fracote do seu filho em Rochedo Casterly? Não me parece.                        | Accuracy    |
| 911 | "Mothers." The man<br>made the word<br>sound like a curse.<br>"I think birthing<br>does <b>something</b> to<br>your minds. You are | - Mães - o homem<br>fez a palavra soar<br>como uma praga<br>Acho que dar à luz<br>faz <b>qualquer coisa</b><br>às vossas mentes. | Idiom       |

|      | all mad." He<br>laughed. It was a<br>bitter sound.  | São todas loucas -<br>ele riu, um som<br>amargo.  |            |
|------|---|---|------------|
| 917  | My husband grows<br>more restless every<br>day. <b>Having Stark</b><br><b>beside him</b> will only<br>make him worse. | Meu marido fica dia<br>a dia mais inquieto.<br><b>Stark a seu lado</b> só<br>o fará ficar pior.                               | Smoothness |
| 935  | "He saw us," the woman said shrilly. "So he did," the man said.   | <ul><li>Ele nos viu - disse</li><li>a mulher com voz</li><li>esganiçada.</li><li>Pois viu.</li></ul>                          | Smoothness |
| 950  | His reading lamp was flickering, its oil all but gone, as dawn light leaked through the high windows.                 | Sua lanterna de leitura bruxuleava, com o óleo quase gasto, enquanto a luz da madrugada se esgueirava pelas janelas elevadas. | Logic      |
| 980  | A shadow fell across<br>his face. He turned<br>to find Clegane<br>looming overhead<br>like a <b>cliff</b> .           | Uma sombra caiu- lhe sobre o rosto. Virou-se e deparou com Clegane, que se erguia acima da sua cabeça como uma falésia.       | Idiom      |
| 1013 | "There is <b>something</b> unnatural about those animals," she said.  | - Há <b>qualquer coisa</b><br>que não é natural<br>nesses animais -<br>disse.   | Idiom      |
| 1015 | "You'll have a hard<br>time stopping them,<br>sister. They follow<br>those girls<br>everywhere."                      | - Teremos<br>dificuldade em<br>impedi-los de ir,<br>irmã. Eles seguem<br>aquelas moças para<br>todo lado.                     | Accuracy   |
| 1045 | She had her meals brought to her there, and <b>chamber pots</b>   | Ordenara que as<br>refeições lhe fossem<br>trazidas, e também   | Accuracy   |

|      | as well, and a small<br>hard bed to sleep on,<br>though it was said<br>she had scarcely<br>slept at all.   | os <b>banhos</b> e uma<br>pequena cama dura<br>para dormir, embora<br>se dissesse que<br>quase não tinha<br>dormido                        |             |
|------|--|--|-------------|
| 1068 | I went to the sept<br>and prayed seven<br>times to the seven<br>faces of god that<br>Ned would change<br>his mind and leave<br>him here with me. | Fui até o septo e<br>rezei sete vezes os<br>sete <b>rostos</b> de deus<br>para que Ned<br>mudasse de idéia e o<br>deixasse aqui<br>comigo. | Idiom       |
| 1080 | Wagons were being loaded, men were shouting, horses were being harnessed and saddled and led from the <b>stables</b> .                           | Carregavam-se carroças, homens gritavam, eram postas armaduras e selas em cavalos que eram tirados da cavalariça.                          | Idiom       |
| 1098 | "Uncle Benjen said<br>to send you to the<br>stables if I saw<br>you,"  | Tio Benjen disse<br>para mandá-lo para<br>os <b>estábulos</b> se o<br>visse  | Consistency |
| 1095 | "Farewell, Snow."  | - Até a vista, Snow.   | Idiom       |
| 1097 | "And you, Stark."  | - Até a vista, Stark.  | Idiom       |
| 1140 | "I better go. I'll spend my first year on the Wall emptying chamber pots if I keep Uncle Ben waiting any longer."                                | Tenho de ir. Acabarei passando o primeiro ano na Muralha a despejar penicos se deixar Tio Benjen à espera mais tempo.                      | Smoothness  |
| 1154 | "Best we get<br>Princess Daenerys<br>wedded quickly  | - É melhor que<br>casemos depressa a<br>Princesa Daenerys,   | Accuracy    |

|      | before they hand<br>half the wealth of<br>Pentos away to sell<br>swords and <b>bravos</b> ,"<br>Ser Jorah Mormont<br>jested.   | antes que entreguem<br>metade da riqueza<br>de Pentos a<br>mercenários e<br>sicários - brincou<br>Sor Jorah Mormont.   |             |
|------|--|--|-------------|
| 1155 | Magister Illyrio laughed lightly through his forked beard, but Viserys did not so much as smile.   | Magíster Illyrio soltou uma ligeira gargalhada através da barba bifurcada, mas Viserys nem sequer sorriu.  | Idiom       |
| 1172 | A mighty earthen ramp had been raised amid the grass palaces, and there Dany was seated beside Khal Drogo, above the seething sea of Dothraki.   | Um monumental talude de terra fora erguido entre os palácios de erva e Dany foi colocada ali sentada, ao lado de Khal Drogo, sobre o fervente mar de dothrakis.  | Accuracy    |
| 1172 | They gorged themselves on horseflesh roasted with honey and peppers, drank themselves blind on fermented mare's milk and Illyrio's fine wines, and spat jests at each other across the fires, their voices harsh and alien in Dany's ears. | Empanturravam-se de carne de cavalo assada com mel e pimentões, bebiam leite fermentado de égua e os vinhos delicados de Illyrio até cair e cuspiam ditos de espírito uns aos outros, por cima das fogueiras, com vozes ásperas e estranhas aos ouvidos de Dany. | Smoothness  |
| 1175 | Khal Drogo shouted<br>commands and <b>jests</b><br>down to his<br>bloodriders, and   | Khal Drogo gritava<br>ordens e<br><b>brincadeiras</b> aos<br>companheiros de   | Consistency |

|      | laughed at their                    | conque a ria da cues          |       |
|------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------|-------|
|      | laughed at their                    | sangue, e ria de suas         |       |
|      | replies, but he                     | respostas, mas quase          |       |
|      | scarcely glanced at Dan beside him. | não olhava para o             |       |
|      |                                     | seu lado.                     |       |
|      | When at last the sun                | Quando o sol por              |       |
|      | was low in the sky,                 | fim baixou no céu,            |       |
|      | Khal Drogo clapped                  | Khal Drogo bateu              |       |
| 1184 | his hands together,                 | palmas, e os                  | Idiom |
|      | and the drums and                   | tambores, os gritos e         |       |
|      | the shouting and                    | o <b>festim</b> chegaram a    |       |
|      | feasting came to a                  | um súbito fim.                |       |
|      | sudden halt.                        | D                             |       |
|      | Drogo stood and                     | Drogo ergueu-se e             |       |
|      | pulled Dany to her                  | pôs Dany de pé a              |       |
| 1184 | feet beside him. <u>It</u>          | seu lado. <u>Tinha</u>        | Idiom |
|      | was time for her                    | chegado o tempo               |       |
|      | bride gifts.                        | dos seus presentes            |       |
|      | m 1 1 1 1 1                         | de noiva.                     |       |
|      | The last was black,                 | O último era negro,           |       |
|      | as black as a                       | tão negro como o              |       |
| 4400 | midnight sea, yet                   | mar da meia-noite,            | * **  |
| 1190 | alive with scarlet                  | mas vivo, com                 | Idiom |
|      | ripples and <b>swirls</b> .         | ondulações e                  |       |
|      |                                     | remoinhos                     |       |
|      | C1                                  | escarlates.                   |       |
|      | She was a young                     | Era uma potranca              |       |
|      | filly, spirited and                 | jovem, espirituosa e          |       |
|      | splendid. Dany                      | magnífica. Dany               |       |
| 1202 | knew just enough                    | sabia apenas o                | Idiom |
| 1203 | about horses to                     | suficiente sobre              | igiom |
|      | know that this was                  | cavalos para                  |       |
|      | no <b>ordinary</b> animal.          | reconhecer que                |       |
|      |                                     | aquele não era um             |       |
|      | There was                           | animal vulgar.                |       |
|      | something about her                 | Havia algo nela que cortava a |       |
| 1203 | that <b>took the breath</b>         | respiração.                   | Idiom |
|      |                                     | i cspii açav.                 |       |
|      | away.                               |                               |       |

| 1239 | After a while he began to touch her. <b>Lightly</b> at first, then harder. | Um pouco mais<br>tarde, começou a<br>tocá-la. A princípio<br>ligeiramente,<br>depois com mais | Logic |
|------|--|---|-------|
|      |  | força.  |       |

Appendix 2: Cover of the PT-BR edition, A Guerra dos Tronos



Appendix 3: Cover of the EN-US edition, A Game of Thrones

